Human Resources Development Canada

A REVIEW OF PROGRAMS FOR INTEGRATING SOCIAL ASSISTANCE RECIPIENTS INTO THE WORKFORCE

Evaluation and Data Development
Strategic Policy
December 1996

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This report was produced to draw lessons learned from numerous evaluative studies concerning a variety of programs designed to integrate social assistance recipients into the workforce. It was prepared on behalf of Evaluation and Data Development by BMCI Consulting Inc.

We wish to thank all those who cooperated by providing access to relevant information for this project, including various knowledgeable and helpful representatives of: Human Resources Development Canada; provincial governments; Canadian and American private, not-for-profit and para-public agencies; and governmental and university libraries. Their commitment of time, effort and goodwill are appreciated.

We expect that, by consolidating much information on this subject, this evaluative review will facilitate the task of individuals wishing to examine this important socio-economic issue.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

1.0 INTRODUCTION **1**
1.1 Background 1
1.2 Purpose 1
1.3 Focus 2
1.4 Literature 2
1.5 Limitations 3
1.6 Organization of the Report 4

2.0 AN OVERVIEW OF SOCIAL ASSISTANCE PROGRAMS **6**
2.1 Evolution of Social Assistance in Canada: An Historical Primer 6
2.2 A Synopsis of Programs and Their Evaluations 8
2.2.1 Training Programs 9
2.2.2 Job Search Assistance 14
2.2.3 Work Experience Programs 15
2.2.4 Wage Subsidies 16
2.2.5 Earnings Supplement Programs 17
2.2.6 Job Placement Services 18
2.2.7 Mixed Strategies 18

3.0 LESSONS LEARNED **23**
3.1 Results of On-The-Job Training Programs 23
3.1.1 Lessons Learned 28
3.2 Results of Classroom Training 29
3.2.1 Lessons Learned 32
3.3 Results of Pre-Employment Training Programs 33
3.3.1 Lessons Learned 35
3.4 Results of Life Skills Training Programs 36
3.4.1 Lessons Learned 37
3.5 Results of Job Search Assistance Programs 37
3.5.1 Lessons Learned 38
3.6 Results of Work Experience 38
3.6.1 Lessons Learned 39
3.7 Results of Wage Subsidies 40
3.7.1 Lessons Learned 43
3.8 Results of Earnings Supplements 44
3.8.1 Lessons Learned 45
3.9 Results of Job Placement Services 45
3.9.1 Lessons Learned 47
3.10 Results of Mixed Strategies 47
3.10.1 Lessons Learned 53

4.0 SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS **54**
4.1 Overall Impacts on Employability 54
4.2 Overall Impacts on Earnings 54
4.3 Overall Impacts on Social Assistance Dependency and Payments 59
4.4 Overall Conclusion 59

BIBLIOGRAPHY **62**

106-02502/

1.0 INTRODUCTION

1.1 Background

In the past few decades, as a result of escalating budget deficits and increasing calls for enhanced public sector fiscal responsibility, governments have been examining and introducing measures aimed at delivering more cost-effective services. The fiscal realities of the 1980s and 90s, and the societal demands for improved public sector accountability culminated in a number of expenditure reforms in which governments world-wide were compelled to institute expenditure reduction initiatives as means to achieving balanced budgets.

One of the more publicly conspicuous and scrutinized targets of these expenditure reduction thrusts has been in the realm of social assistance and income support. Faced with increasing caseloads of social assistance recipients, and corresponding expenditure growth, more and more governments world-wide have begun to identify social assistance and/or welfare reform as a viable tool for achieving short and long run budget reduction goals.

In order to meet these short and long term goals, however, it became increasingly clear among policy-makers that simple reductions to social assistance entitlements or more stringent eligibility criteria would not be sufficient. More innovative approaches to reducing the growing number of individuals receiving social assistance benefits would also be necessary.

Governments viewed this hybrid philosophy as essential for meeting both short and long term goals. In the short run, more stringent eligibility requirements and lower payments to social assistance recipients would provide immediate respite from spiralling federal and provincial budgetary woes. In the long run, a reformed system aimed at reducing continued dependence on income support programs, and improving self-sufficiency among social assistance recipients, would reduce future needs and enhance long term economies to income support accounts by producing savings which exceed initial expenditures.

For instance, in Canada, in the late 1980s and early 1990s, federal, provincial, and territorial ministers responsible for social assistance and labour market affairs came to an agreement for integrating social assistance recipients into the workforce. This agreement allocated funds for the development of new or expanded training and work experience opportunities for social assistance recipients and increased financial incentives for training and/or work opportunities.

Coinciding with the evolving design and delivery of social assistance programs came a need to identify the extent to which these initiatives have been effective in enhancing the employability of recipients, integrating them into the labour market, and subsequently reducing the costs of social assistance to governments.

1.2 Purpose

The purpose of this study is to bring together a vast body of literature pertaining to the evaluation, assessment, and/or review of programs designed to integrate social assistance recipients into the workforce. This report synthesizes the information contained in previous evaluative studies with a view to identifying programs, and pilot and demonstration projects implemented since the early 1980s, whose objectives are to improve the employability

of social assistance recipients. This review also endeavours to estimate the impacts of these programs on improving the employability, self-sufficiency and labour market integration of recipients of social assistance.

In addition, where the data are available, the research and analysis conducted in this review identifies the conditions under which these programs have worked more effectively, determines the relative costs and benefits associated with the programs, and delineates the lessons learned from the experiences with these initiatives.

1.3 Focus

While the focus of this report revolves around the evaluative work conducted to estimate the outcomes of programs designed and delivered at the provincial levels in Canada, much of the information contained in this document relies on studies conducted on welfare to work programs in the United States.

The original scope of this study included a review of studies on programs designed to integrate social assistance recipients into the workforce in other OECD countries. However, because of the apparent limited availability of these reports, they are not included in this document.

The lessons learned from these programs and subsequent evaluations in Canada and the U.S. provide further evidence germane to the social value of investing public funds into enhancing the employability of social assistance recipients. Moreover, it is anticipated that this synthesized knowledge base which combines findings contained in Canadian and U.S. studies related to integrating social assistance recipients into the workforce will provide valuable in-roads for the future design, direction, and revitalization of welfare to work programs which serve the public interest, provide adequate social support for those in need, and are consistent with government policy objectives.

1.4 Literature

For the purposes of this study, three types of documents were reviewed. The first consists of program-specific assessments or evaluations. These studies were designed to address objectives achievement and impact issues of specific programs and services. They tend to review and assess the outcomes of individual programs on participants and their labour market experiences. In addition, some provide discussions relating to cost-effectiveness and cost-efficiency aspects of the program.

The second type of literature reviewed consists of process evaluations and/or implementation reviews. These studies, while focussed on specific programs, concentrate on delivery aspects and preliminary results of their respective initiatives. Success with program implementation and processes are the major foci of these types of reports.

The final type of literature reviewed in this study includes studies which provide general overviews of social assistance programs and philosophies from a more academic perspective. This literature tends to provide syntheses of various programs and services to social assistance recipients from a more critical viewpoint. They identify the approaches to social assistance which have worked and which have not worked based on theoretical economic and social analytical frameworks. Many of these publications formulate recommendations regarding future directions for income support programs.

The literature search conducted for this study consisted of making contact with representatives at Human Resources Development Canada (HRDC) and provincial governments to request titles of evaluations, reviews, studies and/or assess-

ments of programs designed to integrate social assistance recipients into the workforce. Contact was also made with Canadian and American private, not-for-profit and para-public agencies involved in studying social assistance programs such as the Social Research and Demonstration Corporation (SRDC), the Manpower Demonstration Research Corporation (MDRC), and the National Council of Welfare. Extensive library searches in Canada and the U.S. were also conducted to identify additional sources of information not obtained from the above sources.

1.5 Limitations

While every attempt has been made to develop a report which would accurately reflect the vast array of programs designed to integrate social assistance recipients into the workforce, the reader must recognize that there are a number of limitations inherent in this study.

First, the report by no means represents an exhaustive review of all literature pertaining to the subject. The investigation undertaken to identify appropriate literature relevant to this current review discovered a number of studies assessing programs designed to enhance the employability of social assistance recipients conducted for governments which have not yet been released to the public. In addition, searches for applicable evaluative work identified many programs which have either never been evaluated, or which have only recently been implemented, and, despite the frameworks which are in place for evaluating the outcomes of several of these programs, results are not yet available. Furthermore, although dozens of previous research on welfare to work programs have been identified and incorporated into this report, there nevertheless remain countless evaluation studies which have either not been identified, or which could not be obtained.

A second limitation of this report pertains to the extent to which the findings from individual reports can be compared and the degree to which generalizations can be made. Each program was designed and implemented in different settings. Programs under review in this study served varying target groups, were implemented during different economic environments, and were designed to achieve objectives using different approaches and from various philosophical perspectives.

Moreover, the methodological frameworks applied to assess the programs included in this review varied from one study to the next. For instance, certain studies referred to in this document relied heavily on various qualitative approaches to estimating outcomes, while others utilized considerably more rigorous quantitative techniques. As a result of distinctions such as this, the information contained in the literature reviewed regarding the impacts and costs and benefits cannot easily be generalized, and conclusions about program impacts, program effectiveness and lessons learned are not readily comparable. As well, interpreting cost-benefit analyses is a complex process, especially since they are based on various assumptions.

The reader should also be aware that this literature review does not constitute a critique of previous studies or their methodological rigour. Rather, it is a synthesis of the information contained in these reports. It is assumed that the studies reviewed in this current study are sound and accurate reflections of program outcomes.

Another important point to recognize is that the literature reviewed and reported on in this document in terms of programs delivered in Canada focusses mainly on those programs delivered at the provincial levels.

1.6 Organization of the Report

This review is organized into three sections. The first section provides an historical narrative of the evolution of social assistance programs in Canada. This part of the report also identifies and categorizes programs in Canada and in the U.S. which have recently been implemented and evaluated, and discusses their objectives in their historical context.

The second part of the report presents a discussion of the impacts of these programs in terms of integrating social assistance recipients into the workforce based on the findings identified in the literature which was reviewed. This section also provides an analysis of the conditions under which programs have worked well and have not worked well. Furthermore, where applicable, the relative costs and benefits associated with these programs are discussed.

This section also presents the lessons learned from the experiences with programs designed to integrate social assistance recipients into the workforce. The lessons learned are based on conclusions derived from the results emerging from these studies, and subsequent synthesis and analysis of the findings.

The final section of the report provides a summary of the lessons learned from the evaluations reviewed for this document; presents an overview of what has worked well and what has not worked well for various sub-groups of participants by type of program; and offers a set of overall conclusions with respect to the effectiveness of programs designed to integrate social assistance recipients into the workforce.

2.0 AN OVERVIEW OF SOCIAL ASSISTANCE PROGRAMS

2.1 Evolution of Social Assistance in Canada: An Historical Primer

From the early 17th Century up until the Great Depression of the 1930s, Canadian social assistance policy mirrored the welfare philosophies of England's "Elizabethan Poor Law" legislation. The provision of social assistance to individuals who were unable to support themselves or to obtain an adequate level of subsistence after having exhausted their personal resources was the responsibility of local parishes, the equivalent of today's municipal governments. While these local organizations were responsible for making work available to those in need who were employable, and for enforcing disciplinary action to those who were deemed able but unwilling to work, the caseload (and corresponding financial commitments required to support the "poor") was such that it did not represent a significant fiscal constraint.

At that time, social assistance recipients typically included individuals who were widowed, orphaned, aged or had physical or mental disabilities. These recipients were generally referred to charitable organizations under the auspices of parishes or municipalities.

At the turn of the 20th Century, as caseloads increased as a result of urbanization and industrialization, the costs of providing relief to the needy became such a burden to local authorities that federal and provincial governments began to assume increased responsibility for supporting the poor. In addition, the Great Depression of the 1930's had a significant impact on reducing labour force participation, and subsequently, on the delivery of assistance to individuals requiring financial aid.

As a larger proportion of the population began to rely on income assistance, the economic pressures associated with supporting these individuals necessitated increased involvement of federal and provincial governments in the provision of social assistance. Accompanying the augmented federal and provincial government presence was a fundamental shift in delivery mechanisms, from locally-driven charity-based provision of income support toward more centralized publicly financed approaches.

In a related vein, increased federal and provincial intervention was marked by the passing of several pieces of legislation directed at redistributing wealth and protecting less fortunate members of society. In 1914, the Ontario government passed the *Workman's Compensation Act* designed to fund programs which would serve the needs of individuals injured on the job. The *Old Age Pensions Act* of 1927 provided for a shared federal and provincial support for the elderly in financial need. In the 1950s, Canadians witnessed increased government intervention designed to avoid the dismal economic conditions of the depression. A number of specific groups were targeted for financial assistance as part of such federal legislation as the *Old Age Security Act*, the *Old Age Assistance Act*, the *Blind Persons Act*, the *Disabled Persons Act*, and the

Rehabilitation Services Act. In 1956, the *Unemployment Assistance Act* was passed to provide assistance to Canadians in financial need who were not covered by current federal and provincial programs.

Despite these government efforts to redistribute income, there appeared to be a legislative void in terms of programs designed to help the typically employable person leave welfare. The majority of programs were developed to assist those deemed unable to compete in the labour market, and virtually ignored individuals seen as employable seeking to re-enter the workforce.

By the 1960s, needy Canadians were offered a variety of individual federal and provincial income support programs, each serving individualized needs. These were primarily uncoordinated income assistance efforts aimed at serving varying segments of the population. In the mid- 1960s, however, negotiations between the federal and provincial governments for consolidating these existing programs led to the enactment of the *Canada Assistance Plan* (CAP).

CAP introduced new cost-sharing arrangements between federal and provincial governments for the delivery of social assistance programs in which eligibility would be based on need. While the federal government shared the financial responsibility for these programs, provinces would be responsible for the design and administration of social assistance in their respective jurisdictions.

In terms of employability improvements, Section Three of CAP called for the implementation of "Work Activities Projects" to provide work experience, training and counselling to specific groups of unemployed disadvantaged individuals.

In the 1970s, the federal government implemented a number of programs designed to provide unemployed individuals with short-term employment during the prevailing period of accelerated labour market growth in support of "socially useful activities." Many of these programs, such as the Local Employment Assistance Program (LEAP), provided funding to communities for the development of projects to serve local needs.

By the 1980s, however, as a result of the growing number of employable Canadians on welfare, federal and provincial governments adopted new approaches in the delivery of social assistance. These revitalized income support programs were aimed at providing help to employable social assistance recipients who were victims of the recession and who were becoming dependent on income support.

During the early 1980s, the recession resulted in a 30% increase in the social assistance caseload over that during the economic boom of the 1970s. In some regions of Canada, this increase was as high as 100%, with the majority of these individuals considered employable. Moreover, the profile of social assistance recipients was changing. Social assistance recipients were no longer only individuals who had disabilities or were disadvantaged. Rather, social assistance recipient caseloads were increasingly comprised of individuals who were willing and able to work, but who could not find employment in the newly-emerging economy. In addition, as a result of the evolving labour market, the demand for highly skilled and/or technically specialized workers meant that many traditional skills held by these individuals were no longer relevant.

This skill shortage among social assistance recipients, coupled with an expanding supply of labour, resulted in post-recessionary numbers of recipients which were maintained at the levels reached during the recession.

The Canadian Jobs Strategy (CJS), implemented in 1984, was initiated to provide active support to those individuals who were becoming dependent on social assistance. By focussing on equity groups (i.e., women, Aboriginal people, persons with disabilities, and visible minorities), the CJS was able to address the needs of a large portion of the social assistance caseload through training and work experience initiatives.

Despite these efforts, however, it was becoming clear to federal and provincial policy-makers that additional approaches were required to deal with the continually growing numbers of people in need of social assistance.

In 1985, the federal, provincial, and territorial ministers responsible for social assistance and labour market affairs came to a seven point agreement for integrating social assistance recipients into the workforce. Some of the key elements contained in this agreement include: diverting funds from CAP toward the development of new or expanded training and work experience opportunities for social assistance recipients; increasing financial incentives for training and/or work opportunities; and conducting rigorous assessments of the efforts initiated to enhance the employability of social assistance recipients.

By 1988, all provincial and territorial governments had signed the agreement with the exception of Yukon. In that year, nearly $200 million was transferred from CAP to training, job creation, and work experience programs. Over 43,000 social assistance recipients were provided with programming assistance (approximately 9% of the social assistance caseload).

These agreements provided the framework for launching new and expanded programs through the diversion of funds from CAP. For instance, many provinces implemented wage subsidy programs formerly not permitted under CAP. Provinces also began to deliver programs designed to ease the transition of social assistance recipients into the labour market with pre-employment training, counselling, assessments and referrals. In addition, a number of provinces started innovative approaches to helping recipients such as self-employment incentives and entrepreneurial training.

These programs, as well as others implemented as a result of the two rounds of Federal-Provincial Agreements to Enhance the Employability of Social Assistance Recipients (1988 and 1991-96), marked the beginning of the federal-provincial coordination of efforts still in place today.

In addition to these initiatives, in 1992, HRDC launched the Self-Sufficiency Project (SSP), to be managed by the Social Research and Demonstration Corporation. The SSP is a unique demonstration project in which earnings supplements are paid to social assistance recipients on top of earnings from employment. It is anticipated that the earnings supplement would act as an incentive for recipients to accept lower paying entry level positions which they otherwise would not have accepted because the wages (minus the cost of working) may not have equalled the social assistance support received. As a demonstration project, the SSP is being evaluated on an on-going basis.

2.2 A Synopsis of Programs and Their Evaluations

Evaluative studies conducted for a number of programs designed to integrate social assistance recipients into the workforce have been identified in this review. These studies have primarily been completed for initiatives delivered in Canada and the United States.

Particularly since the Federal-Provincial Agreement to

Enhance the Employability of Social Assistance Recipients, provincial governments have undertaken several studies to assess the impact of their programs on increasing the employability and labour market integration of individuals in receipt of income assistance.

Similarly, the Manpower Demonstration Research Corporation (MDRC) in the United States has produced a myriad of studies pertaining to the effectiveness of their demonstration projects. The MDRC is a not-for-profit organization operating in the United States to design and evaluate approaches to encouraging self-sufficiency among individuals in receipt of social assistance. Since the 1970s, their efforts have concentrated on improving the employment prospects of disadvantaged Americans, including reducing welfare dependency, lessening poverty, and enhancing employment opportunities for employment disadvantaged individuals.

As previously mentioned, the original scope of the study was to include a review of the literature from other OECD countries. Unfortunately, the study's investigation for international literature found that only limited information seems to be available concerning evaluations of employability enhancement programs for social assistance recipients in other OECD countries. Studies found from these countries tend to be more general and theoretical in nature instead of reporting on assessments of such specific programs. As a result, the following synopsis concerns programs which have undergone evaluative assessments focussed solely in Canada and the United States.

Based on an analysis of the information obtained from the literature, programs for integrating social assistance into the workforce can be comfortably categorized into seven groups based on the type of service or product delivered and/or the delivery mechanisms used to delivery the initiatives. For the purposes of this review, the programs have been grouped into the following categories:

- training;
- job search assistance;
- work experience;
- wage subsidies;
- earnings supplements;
- job placement; and
- mixed strategies.

A summary of some of the major components of each of the programs, both past and current, identified for this review is presented below. Some programs do not fall routinely into one category.

2.2.1 Training Programs

Many governments have identified training as an appropriate means to integrating social assistance recipients into the workforce. Programs initiated in this category offer training which ranges from classroom instruction for academic upgrading or vocational skills enhancement, to on-the-job training. Some programs offer participants with additional ancillary training such as life skills and pre-employment training in an effort to improve personal and professional development. For the purposes of this review, training programs have been categorized into: On-The-Job Training; Classroom Training; Pre-Employment Training; and Life Skills Training. There is sometimes crossover between these categories.

• *ON-THE-JOB TRAINING*

British Columbia's on-the-job training programs offer social assistance recipients training opportunities working on projects undertaken by government and not-for-profit organizations. These programs provide employers with a wage subsidy, while employers are expected to make contributions to the participant's benefit plan.

The duration of the training varies from six to twelve months. Initiatives under this program include the Community Tourism Employment Training Program, the Forest Enhancement Program, and the Environment Youth Corps.

With the assistance of major Canadian banks, the Edmonton Goodwill Rehabilitation Service provides on-the-job training to Aboriginal social assistance recipients to encourage them to become bank tellers. The program recruits participants through local employment centres and advertizing. Successful applicants are first provided with nine weeks of classroom training, followed by eight weeks of a combination of classroom and on-the-job training. In the final eight weeks, trainees work full time as tellers in participating banks.

The Training on the Job Program in Alberta provides job ready social assistance recipients, who are identified as being motivated to enter the labour market but who lack the necessary work experience or skills, with work experience and relevant job skills training. Program clients are placed into private sector jobs and become actual "employees" of the business. They receive work experience and job specific skills training at the host employer's worksite, while employers receive funding in the form of training credits to offset the cost of providing the training. The program aims to be client-oriented and flexible, and to focus on individual client needs. It is delivered via a mix of provincial government and contracted private sector organizations.

On-the-job training in Saskatchewan is primarily delivered through the New Careers Corporation (NCC) Work Experience and Training Program. This initiative, established in 1984 as a means to enhancing long-term employment prospects of social assistance recipients, provides participants with work experience and training in the construction field. In addition, the NCC offers trainees career and personal counselling, financial allowances during instructional terms, and job search assistance.

The jobsOntario - Training Program, introduced in 1992, helps clients develop a training action plan and provides on-the-job training to them. Training is conducted on-site with host employers. Employer participants receive compensation for the training provided in the form of a training credit over a one year credit period.

In order to facilitate their integration into the workforce, Quebec social assistance recipients are offered the Stage en milieu du travail (PSMT) program. The work placement includes an identification of the position, a job description, a plan for training outside of the normal production process, and a follow-up plan. The employer during the work placement is provided with a modest wage subsidy, and the participant is supplied with financial assistance to help offset the cost of the eligible training.

The Program in Newfoundland to Enhance the Employability of Social Assistance Recipients, while open to all individuals in receipt of income support, focusses on family heads and single parents. Its goal is to provide classroom and on-the-job training to participants in order to enhance their future employability. The program also provides counselling and job search assistance to clients, and participation typically ranges from 16 to 52 weeks.

In terms of on-the-job training in the U.S., when it was evaluated in 1988, the New Jersey OJT experiment placed eligible clients into positions with local employers, the majority of which were private sector organizations. Trainees were hired for a six month probationary period, but were guaranteed regular full time employment given satisfactory performance. During the probation period, 50% of the wages paid to participants were provided by the New Jersey OJT project.

The approach adopted by the Maine OJT project utilizes a three phase procedure for providing on-the-job training to enhance the employability of welfare recipients. In the fist phase, clients are provided with life skills, job search and "job-building" training. The second phase, if deemed necessary, consists of short-term part-time unpaid work experience with public or private sector employers. The final phase of this program places recipients into a six month work term, and provides host employers with a subsidy equal to one-half of the participant's wages.

- ***CLASSROOM TRAINING***

Employment enhancement assistance in British Columbia is provided to social assistance recipients through classroom instruction delivered via community colleges and contracted institutions. Four basic classroom training streams are delivered through these programs. These include vocational training, career technical training, Adult Basic Education, and academic upgrading.

In Alberta, the Skills Development Program provides financially disadvantaged adults with access to sufficient education and training to allow them to attain independence through employment. The initiative offers financial assistance to eligible clients for pursuing secondary and post-secondary full-time studies. Clients must maintain regular attendance and demonstrate satisfactory academic progress.

The Office Skills Development program, delivered through private sector agencies in Alberta, provides social assistance recipients with a combination of classroom training in basic office skills and relevant work experience with host employers. The goal of the program is to enhance the job-readiness and employability of worker clients, who continue to receive social assistance benefits throughout their participation.

The Academic Upgrading Program utilizing Computer Assisted Instruction in Calgary provides computer assisted academic upgrading to social assistance recipients through three contracted training delivery agents. The aim of this program is to increase the participant's employability through the development of basic academic and life skills. The primary objective of this program is to improve the client's opportunities for gaining meaningful employment, or for enrolling in additional relevant training.

Around the time of its evaluation in 1985-86, the Saskatchewan Skills Development Program provided assistance to job-ready recipients of income support who required additional education and training to successfully compete in the labour market. Services offered through this program included Basic Adult Education, and pre-employment and community-based training. Other support services such as child care and counselling were available to trainees.

The Ontario Special Bursary Plan under the Ontario Student Assistance Plan offers bursaries to social assistance recipients seeking to become full or part time students at post-secondary institutions and for academic upgrading at community colleges. The assistance provided is intended to help offset the costs of tuition, books, supplies, transportation and day care.

Social assistance recipients participating in the Student Work and Service Program in Newfoundland under the Federal-Provincial Strategic Initiatives are involved in the Community Service component of the initiative. This component provides students with stipends and vouchers for undertaking post-secondary studies, and clients continue to receive their social assistance payments.

In Quebec, the Rattrapage scolaire (RS) program seeks to enhance the employment prospects of younger social

assistance recipients by providing them with financial assistance for completing their secondary education. The assistance is provided to cover the costs of tuition, supplies, and day care.

In the U.S., a number of states have implemented similar training-oriented programs through the MDRC. For example, in the Baltimore Options Project, welfare recipients are provided with classroom training ranging from Adult Basic Education to specific job skills training. These mandatory training sessions last anywhere from one week to 18 months, depending on the type of training required.

The Job Corps Computer-Assisted Instruction Project across the U.S. provides trainees with basic academic skills upgrading and GED preparation. This instruction is delivered in traditional classroom settings, with some courses offering extensive computer-assisted instruction.

In addition, voluntary participants in the Seattle/Denver Income Maintenance Experiments were offered a 100%, 50% or no subsidy for education and training expenses, depending on the clients' random assignment. Around the time that these projects were being evaluated in 1986, they offered academic upgrading and job skills training, as well as vocational counselling and financial support for child care expenses.

Training targeted at equity groups is also provided through many MDRC demonstration projects. For instance, the Minority Female Single Parent Demonstration project provides mixed and comprehensive training to single mothers, including classroom instruction, academic upgrading, job skills training, employability training, and support services.

In addition, while they were being studied in 1986, a mixture of classroom and on-the-job training was provided through the AFDC Homemaker-Home Health Aide Demonstration Projects. These initiatives, provided to people with disabilities, offered four to eight weeks of training, and up to one year of subsidized employment. During this time, participants continued to receive Medicaid benefits as well as work related support services. Moreover, trainees earned wages which were comparable to market value levels.

- ***PRE-EMPLOYMENT TRAINING***

Pre-employment Training Programs are delivered to social assistance recipients in several communities across Alberta primarily through private and non-profit sector contractors. Government contract managers in each region of the province work with the delivery agents to ensure that the programs are delivered according to the terms originally set out and to improve service delivery. Given that the delivery of this Pre-employment Training is highly decentralized, individual regions have developed different approaches to providing training. Overall, however, most programs include job search assistance, counselling and assessment, and life skills training. Other components offered in some of the programs include work placements, skills training, entrepreneurial training and academic upgrading. Regional Pre-employment Training Programs may also differ in terms of target clients. While most programs target all social assistance recipients, specific target clients can include youth, single parents, older workers, aboriginal people, immigrants, ex-offenders, and low or high barriered individuals.

In addition to these programs, the Target Program in Lethbridge offers pre-employment training to social assistance recipients who are seeking to become employed. The program provides clients with up to 75 hours of classroom training covering topics such as generic work skills, personal

and interpersonal skills, family and financial management, and job finding skills. In addition to this training, and depending on the background and career goals of the individual, participants are provided with up to ten weeks of adult academic upgrading and/or computer training. In the job search component of the program, clients are involved in locating vacancies, preparing job applications, making contact with potential employers, and attending interviews. Job-ready clients are placed into temporary employment positions in order to help them acquire work experience.

Alberta's Crossover Program, which was evaluated in 1993 as a demonstration project, was targeted at single parents or heads of households in recept of social assistance for at least six months. The objective of the program was to provide employment preparation services to help clients improve their employment opportunities. The Crossover Program was delivered through private sector agents and operated at arms length from the provincial government.

The Futures Program, delivered in Alberta through the Columbia Institute of Canada, is aimed at assisting social assistance recipients obtain and maintain employment by offering clients pre-employment training. The training is provided over a two-week period and is designed to improve the employment readiness of its participants.

- ***LIFE SKILLS TRAINING***

The Integrated Training Pilot Project initiated in 1994 by the Advanced Education and Career Development, and the Family and Social Services departments of Alberta, was designed to provide training to employable, but highly-barriered social assistance recipients for improving their employability and ultimate integration into the workforce. The program contracted out the services to four separate delivery agents to provide life skills training, employment preparation, career planning, job skills training, and some academic upgrading.

In addition, the YWCA Employment Preparation and Support Program of Alberta is designed to help women on social assistance who are experiencing difficulties obtaining employment as a result of a number of employment barriers. The program takes a holistic approach by addressing the gamut of client needs. The initiative offers participants group sessions in career planning and life skills training, as well as job shadowing and individual counselling services.

Similarly, the Life Skills Training Centre in Calgary combines instruction for life skills with a work experience, as well as a career planning component. The program is based on the premise that the barriers in terms of gaining meaningful employment faced by social assistance recipients are a function of their inability to cope with everyday problems, rather than a result of skill shortages. Given this philosophy, the program concentrates on providing instruction related to generic interpersonal and problem-solving skills. Only once participants are comfortable with their level of life skills, are they provided with employment preparation and career exploration services.

Along the same lines, the Contemporary Women Program in Calgary, directed toward single parent women receiving social assistance, consists of providing participants with individual and group counselling, job search skills training, and post-program support. Its objective is to develop the clients' self-esteem and to establish procedures for taking control of their personal and work lives.

One of the components of Florida's Project Independence deals with social assistance recipients who are not considered job-ready. These individuals are provided with a formal skills assessment, then

typically referred to basic education and training courses. In many cases, support services are provided to clients in order to assist them in participating in program activities or to help them secure employment.

Teen mothers and pregnant teens on welfare and who had not obtained a secondary school diploma were provided with training through Project Redirection around the time it was being evaluated in 1985. Services offered under this demonstration project included academic upgrading, life skills training, family training and other support services.

Finally, around 1982 when the Job Corps program model was being studied, it provided economically disadvantaged youth and females collecting welfare with academic upgrading, job skills training, as well as job placement and other support services in residential settings. Conversely, the JOBSTART demonstration projects provided similar services to high school non-completers, but in non-residential settings.

2.2.2 Job Search Assistance

Job search assistance programs are also common means by which social assistance recipients who are considered employable can be integrated into the workforce. This type of service is primarily delivered through job clubs or similar types of organizations. For example, the Job Action Programs in British Columbia are responsible for developing job clubs which provide job-ready recipients with assistance in conducting job searches, in combination with life and job-finding skills training. Clients also receive financial support for such job search related expenses as transportation, clothing, and personal grooming.

In the U.S., however, jobs clubs are only one part of a larger continuum of services provided for assisting welfare recipients in searching and obtaining employment.

Around the time they were being studied in 1987, the two Louisville Work Incentive (WIN) Laboratory Experiments, for instance, provided services designed to help individuals search for employment — one on an individual basis, and the other in group settings. These programs were unique in that, in addition to offering job search assistance to recipients, they also provided services to welfare applicants prior to their being approved for social assistance. The former program consisted of intensive training in generalized and client-specific job search methods, and included procedures for following up and reporting back on employment leads provided by WIN counsellors. Only the latter approach relied on group job clubs in which classroom instruction for training in job search skills was provided. After the classroom training, clients were expected to contact a minimum 50 employment prospects per day for up to five weeks from telephone stations set up in the WIN offices.

In addition, while they were being evaluated in the 1980s, services provided under the Arkansas WORK Program, the Cook County WIN Demonstration project, the San Diego Employment Preparation Program/ Experimental Work Experience Program, the Virginia Employment Services Program, and the San Diego Saturation Work Initiatives Model consisted of two to four weeks of job search assistance. This was delivered either through individual counselling or group job clubs, in which training, modest financial assistance and employment leads were provided to clients.

Finally, a second stream of Florida's Project Independence, which deals with clients considered job-ready, requires participants to adhere to strict job search activities. The program directs clients to contact over a dozen employ-

ers per day to apply for employment. Those who are not successful in acquiring employment are to participate in group courses relating to job search techniques, resume preparation, and interview skills. Employability action plans may also be developed in consultation with counsellors depending on the client's success in finding employment.

2.2.3 Work Experience Programs

Many job-ready social assistance recipients are also encouraged to participate in work experience programs. These programs are delivered under the premise that even many entry level jobs require some previous labour market background, and that lack of actual job experience is a significant barrier faced by many employable individuals receiving income assistance. The objectives of these programs are to provide participants with tangible work experience with which they can more effectively compete in the workforce.

One such work experience program is Quebec's Services externes de main d'oeuvre (SEMO). This program provides social assistance recipients facing some labour market disadvantages with work experience, employment related training, and job search assistance. Participants are offered financial assistance to help offset the cost of their job search, and an additional six weeks of support equivalent to current minimum wage levels while participating in the work experience and on-the-job training component of the program.

Quebec also delivers the Expérience de travail (EXTRA) program which offers employable social assistance recipients with work experience opportunities in community projects. Clients are provided with financial support above their current income assistance levels, while employers receive compensation to cover the overhead costs associated with placement. EXTRA aims to assist recipients who have been in receipt of income assistance for at least one year, and allows up to twelve months of participation for any given project.

In the U.S., around the time of its evaluation in 1985, the National Supported Work Demonstration project provided welfare recipients facing some employment barriers with up to 18 months of highly structured work experience. The demonstration project subsidized the wages of participants, and provided these clients with additional support in terms of imparting basic work habits and skills. Participation in this program was voluntary.

On the other hand, the West Virginia Community Work Experience Program of the 1980s obliged welfare recipients to accept unpaid community work as labour market experience. Participation in this program was mandatory in order to continue receiving their welfare benefits.

2.2.4 Wage Subsidies

A fourth group of programs designed to integrate social assistance recipients into the workforce is that of wage subsidies. These programs provide subsidies to employers who hire a participant into generally incremental positions. The purpose of wage subsidy programs is to offer worker participants work experience and on-the-job training opportunities without placing the entire burden on the employer.

In British Columbia, for example, the Employment Opportunities Program offers wage subsidies of up to $3.50 per hour to employers who hire social assistance recipients into incremental positions. The employer is also required to provide on-the-job training to participants, and the job filled by the worker must not displace existing employees. The jobs created for this programs must be full-time positions lasting from two to six months.

In Alberta, the Employment Alternatives Program (EAP) offers social assistance recipients work experience and training opportunities in order to help them obtain permanent employment. Under the EAP, host employers are provided with a partial wage subsidy, as well as additional financial incentives, in exchange for the provision of training and work experience to worker participants.

Similarly, in Quebec, the Programme d'aide à l'intégration en emploi (PAIE), provides wage subsidies to eligible employers for hiring social assistance recipients to incremental positions. The amount of the subsidy varies depending on the type of employment offered (i.e., full-time, part-time, or seasonal) and the type of employer (i.e., private sector, public sector, or not for profit). The program is targeted toward social assistance recipients facing barriers to long-term employment opportunities.

From a different perspective, the NB Job Corps is a joint federal-provincial initiative funded by HRDC, the New Brunswick Department of Advanced Education and Labour, and Human Resource Development New Brunswick. The project provides an annual guaranteed income to older workers (aged 50 to 65) for working with host organizations in positions which contribute to the betterment of the community. NB Job Corps is not solely directed at social assistance recipients. It is also directed at individuals who are 50 years of age or older, those whose family unit income was under $20,000 in the year preceding their participation, Unemployment Insurance benefits recipients or exhaustees, individuals who have been permanently displaced from the workforce, persons for whom retraining is not a realistic goal, and individuals with low educational attainment. Approximately 60% of NB Job Corps participants are social assistance recipients.

Moreover, the Canada Saskatchewan Job Creation Program and the Saskatchewan JOBS Program were joint federal-provincial initiatives for the creation of short-term jobs for individuals who had exhausted their Unemployment Insurance benefits or had been in receipt of social assistance for at least three months. Around the time they were being evaluated in 1984, the programs provided subsidies to host employers equivalent to minimum wage and the employer portion of benefits in exchange for hiring worker participants into incremental employment positions. The goals of the programs were to contribute to the overall social and economic betterment of the community, create incremental jobs, and reduce the need for on-going income support.

Saskatchewan's other wage subsidy program, Saskatchewan Works (originally the Saskatchewan Employment Development Program renamed Saskatchewan Works in 1989), was initiated in 1984 and is designed to create employment opportunities for

job-ready social assistance recipients through wage subsidies provided to host employers. As with the Canada Saskatchewan Job Creation Program and the Saskatchewan JOBS Program, subsidies provided are equivalent to minimum wage plus the employer share of mandatory benefits.

In the United States, wage subsidies are usually combined with on-the-job training or work experience programs. One project which stands out as being a unique U.S. experiment in the provision of wage subsidies, however, is the Youth Incentive Entitlement Pilot Project. This program is targeted at 16 to 19 year olds from lower income or welfare households, who have not yet obtained a secondary school diploma. Participants are offered the opportunity to work in guaranteed minimum wage jobs -- part-time during the school year, and full-time during the summer -- on the condition that they remain active in their academic pursuits and meet academic and job performance standards.

2.2.5 Earnings Supplement Programs

In some programs for social assistance recipients, income supplements are provided to recipients who earn wages from employment. These programs are designed to eliminate the disincentives to working as a result of earnings exemptions (i.e., the maximum amount of income which can be earned by a social assistance recipient before social assistance payments are reduced) and lower paying entry level positions. Earnings supplement programs which have undergone evaluations are described below.

One of Canada's earnings supplement projects is the Self-Sufficiency Project (SSP) operating in British Columbia and New Brunswick. This pilot project offers time-limited earnings supplements as an incentive for long-term social assistance recipients to obtain full-time paid employment. SSP offers an income supplement to recipients who have found a job within one year of participation. This supplement is equal to one-half of the difference between actual earnings and a reference wage level ($30,000 per year in New Brunswick, and $37,000 per year in British Columbia). It is anticipated that the program will encourage participants to obtain full time paid employment which they would not have accepted without the supplement because of the lower wages associated with many entry level positions.

In Quebec, the APPORT program, directed towards low income families with children seeks to improve or maintain the labour market participation of its clients, as well as to reduce dependency on income support.

APPORT provides eligible clients with three types of earnings supplements: a basic supplement; a housing supplement; and a day care supplement.

The level of financial support provided to each participant varies according to family size, employment status, earnings, and income from other sources. The earnings supplement increases until earnings from employment reaches a predetermined level, established with regard to the make up of the family and the level at which the participant is no longer eligible for social assistance receipt. The supplement then decreases progressively, until the family income reaches a level at which one dollar of provincial income tax is payable. Essentially, APPORT provides 33 cents for every one dollar earned by the participant until the family income reaches the predetermined limit. Once this level has been reached, the program withholds 42 cents for every additional dollar of supplement provided to the client until the combination of income from employment and

the supplement reaches a level of total earnings which is taxable. Social assistance recipients are eligible to participate in the program once they have achieved a minimum level of earnings from employment of $100 per month.

With respect to parents whose children require day care, the costs of day care are taken into account in determining the minimum and maximum earnings from employment, which varies from one family to another. In addition, the program provides a supplemental benefit which ranges from 42% to 67% of the cost of day care, depending on the earnings from employment within the family unit (67% when family earnings are less than the predetermined level of earnings discussed above). The program also provides a housing supplement of up to $90 to families with at least one child, and whose rent is higher than that which is within established guidelines for the given family size.

In the U.S., the Minnesota Family Investment Program includes two key components related to attaining an adequate level of self-sufficiency. First, financial incentives and reduced earnings exemptions are provided to participants to ensure that they are better positioned while working than they would be while unemployed. In the second component, clients are directed to develop and follow an action plan for achieving self-sufficiency.

2.2.6 Job Placement Services

Programs with job placement components are typically designed to place job-ready social assistance recipients directly into positions of employment. Individuals participating in these types of programs are seen as requiring very limited support. Rather, their needs are mainly related to the acquisition of labour market information and the skills relevant for following up on employment opportunities.

One such initiative is the Job Placement Program in Alberta. This program is designed to place job-ready clients directly into employment via contracted employment agencies. Through these third party organizations, the program assists participants in identifying job opportunities, preparing resumes, and learning job search and interviewing skills. The contracted agencies are responsible for monitoring clients and following-up on their activities and progress.

Another Alberta job placement program is the Athabasca Regional Career Services (ARCS) program established in 1991. This program combines the services of federal and provincial employment delivery agents, with those of private sector job placement organizations to provide employment preparation services to employable individuals in receipt of social assistance. The ARCS model is based on a seamless service approach in which various service providers co-locate under a single administration and point of delivery.

The Workplace Support Pilot Project provided job placement and on the job training for job-ready individuals with permanent disabilities who were facing severe barriers to labour market activity. This pilot project, which operated in Alberta through a private sector delivery agent from October 1991 to October 1993, targeted those individuals who were found to found to be severely employment disadvantaged as a result of their disability.

2.2.7 Mixed Strategies

Mixed strategy programs offer social assistance recipients with a host of programming options for achieving self-sufficiency and integration into the workforce. While any number of employment assistance components can be provided to participants, these

programs tend to focus on the individual needs of clients.

Around the time that Ontario's Futures program was being reviewed (1987), for instance, it provided funding to assist employment disadvantaged youth (16 to 24 years) in obtaining work through the provision of counselling, skills training, academic upgrading, and/or work experience measures. Futures was made up of two primary components: pre-employment training and work experience placements which provide employers with a full wage subsidy for up to a 16 week placement.

In addition, the Employment Opportunities Program (EOP) in Ontario is designed to ease the transition of single mothers and job-ready youth from social assistance to the labour market. EOP includes eight separate initiatives aimed at integrating clients into the labour market. One such initiative is the Employment Support Initiative (ESI) which provides employment support such as transportation and child care. Another is the Youth Employment Preparation (YEP) program in support of disadvantaged youth requiring employment services and financial assistance for employment related expenses. In addition, the Municipal Job Developer Program was initiated to identify employment opportunities for ESI and YEP clients, while the objectives of the Summer Employment Experience and Part-Time Program is to provide direct work experience to youth dependents of social assistance recipients who are still in secondary school. A fifth component is the Social Service Employment Program which provides temporary work experience to long-term social assistance recipients. The sixth component is the Preparation for Independence Program aimed at helping youth under the care of the crown achieve personal and financial self-sufficiency through life skills and pre-employment training. Another component of EOP is the Community Youth Support Program which offers life skills and pre-employment training in addition to outreach support and guidance. The final component consists of the Residential Component of Futures whose aim is to help youth in marginal living situations through short-term financial supports, life skills training, and counselling.

The Career Training Program is a mixed strategy initiative delivered through the Columbia Institute of Canada in Alberta. Its goals are to provide basic academic upgrading in language arts and mathematics; to develop and enhance generic work skills and work related values, attitudes, and behaviours; to provide opportunities for cooperative education and employment in positions which are relevant and appropriate to career goals and individual needs; and to offer job placement services to job-ready clients.

The Skills Assessment and Training Centre was established in Newfoundland in 1986 as a demonstration project to meet the training imperatives of the Employment Enhancement Program. The Centre was to develop and administer classroom training for social assistance recipients who were assigned to work projects in the Community Development component of the program. After an initial assessment in 1988-89, the Skills Assessment and Training Centre was modified slightly to focus on more appropriate client intake, proper assessment of client needs, and more suitable referrals to training or employment. The Centre currently provides clients with job search assistance (i. e., client assessment, career counselling, resume preparation, interview skills, and job search strategies); job placement opportunities; and access to training.

In Quebec, the Actions positives pour le travail program (APTE) provides income supplements on a sliding scale to social assistance recipients who earn

income from employment, wage subsidies to employers for hiring participants for incremental jobs, and pre-employment training and job search assistance. The overall goal of the program is to provide adequate income assistance to recipients, while encouraging their integration into the workforce.

NB Works is a six year demonstration project managed and delivered through a joint federal-provincial endeavour. This project is designed to provide participants with opportunities for skills acquisition and work experience in order to help in their integration into the labour market, and subsequently reduce government expenses related to the payment of social assistance.

While the delivery of NB Works varies among participants, the project generally consists of a continuum of services which includes a short orientation period (two week duration), an initial job placement (20 week duration), two academic upgrading sessions (nine month duration each), two summer work internships, and skills training (one year duration).

The length of the training and education sessions differ among participants, and typically reflect individualized case plans, career goals, and a three year commitment on the part of the participant.

Finally, the Nova Scotia Compass program is a Federal-Provincial Strategic Initiative designed to provide job-ready social assistance recipients with employment opportunities and work experience. The program offers a number of interventions to its participants, including work experience, wage subsidies, on-the-job training, and self-employment training and incentives.

The United States is also involved in providing services for the integration of welfare recipients into the workforce following the mixed strategy model.

One such initiative is the Job Opportunity Program (JOBS), which is designed to provide welfare recipients with job-search assistance, academic upgrading, work experience, vocational training, and other support services. Participation is mandatory for single parent welfare recipients with children aged three and up, or for at least one adult in a two-parent household. Many U.S. programs described earlier fall under the JOBS portfolio.

Another mixed strategy program, offered by MDRC, is California's GAIN program, initiated to enhance the employment and self-sufficiency of welfare recipients. GAIN provides welfare recipients with basic education, training, and job search assistance as required in order to achieve long-term results in moving them from welfare to the labour market.

The Massachusetts Employment and Training (ET) Program is the state's employment, training and education program for welfare recipients. The program provides clients with a variety of services based on each client's needs, including intensive assessment, career counselling, job search assistance, job placement, remedial education, advanced academic upgrading, occupational and vocational classroom training, and supported work experience. Throughout their participation, clients are provided with day care and transportation subsidies. The Massachusetts ET Program contains certain elements which make it unique compared to similar welfare to work programs in other states. First, the program emphasizes client choice in terms of the type of service preferred and administered to the participant. This is in contrast to many other US programs which offer only a limited range of services and where participation in certain service streams is mandatory. In addition, the program is offered through a mix of direct state delivered and contracted services. This mix is essential for maximizing

resources allocated to the program while providing the most appropriate service to the client. The Massachusetts ET Program is also involved in intensive marketing of its services. The program uses public media and marketing agencies to promote its benefits to potential participants, employers, and other government agencies dealing with welfare recipients.

3.0 LESSONS LEARNED

One of the key issues to be addressed in this review is the extent to which programs designed to enhance the employability of social assistance recipients have successfully integrated these individuals into the labour market. This section of the report analyzes the information contained in evaluative studies of these programs, presents a synthesis of the results by program type, and offers a set of lessons learned from the experiences with the programs reviewed. The lessons learned are based on conclusions derived from the results emerging from the studies reviewed, and subsequent synthesis and analysis of the findings.

Before presenting the results and subsequent lessons learned of the various studies, it is important to reiterate that the methodological approaches utilized in the studies reviewed for this project varied from one study to the next.

For instance, many studies employed a comparison group design and analysis. Specifically, the evaluation of the SSP and most of the U.S. studies sponsored by the MDRC used a random field assignment approach in which each of the sample members was randomly assigned to either a program group (who were provided with services and subject to program requirements) or to a comparison group (who were precluded form the program). These two groups were tracked over time, and the differences between them (with respect to outcomes such as employment, income and social assistance receipt, etc.) were measured to identify statistically significant differences which could be attributed to the program. In other studies, such as the on-the-job training programs in British Columbia, the comparison groups were developed (after program participation had already occurred) from databases of individuals with similar backgrounds and characteristics as program participants, but who never participated in the program.

In addition, certain studies relied solely on pre- and post-program participant information (obtained through existing databases and/or surveys of clients) to measure changes in labour force activity, earnings, and social assistance receipt.

A third type of methodology utilized in some of the studies reviewed for this document was comprised of reviews of program files and relevant literature, and, in some cases, interviews with program personnel and clients. These studies relied on more qualitative information to address delivery and outcome issues related to their respective programs.

A final type of study contained in this review consists of process evaluations or implementation reviews. These studies used various primary and secondary data to study the programs' effectiveness and efficiency in delivering services to clients.

Table 1 summarizes the type of methodology used for each program reviewed in this document. Readers desiring additional methodological details (e.g., sampling frames and samples) are referred to the individual studies. Limited or unknown sample sizes are noted in this section of the report.

3.1 Results of On-The-Job Training Programs

Evaluations of on-the-job training programs, which applied more rigorous statistical analyses and compared program results of participants to those of a comparison group, revealed little or no impacts of

the training on the long term employability of trainees. The British Columbia evaluations (1992) found no statistically significant differences in improved employment in the Community Tourism Employment Training and Environment Youth Corps programs between participants and control group members up to 17 months after program completion. Moreover, the Forest Enhancement Program evaluation found that 20% more comparison group members than participants were employed following program completion. This large negative difference was attributed, however, to the seasonal nature of the forestry industry, in conjunction with the timing of the data collection for the study.

Evaluation results of the three British Columbia on-the-job training programs also showed no program effect on increasing post training wages. This may have been the result of the program helping a number of trainees to find lower paying jobs.

On-the-job training programs in British Columbia, while reducing immediate dependency on social assistance, resulted in increased utilization of Unemployment Insurance (UI). Participants were more likely than comparison group members to receive UI benefits for up to three years after program completion.

Studies of the Edmonton Goodwill Rehabilitation Service in Alberta (1993) and the New Careers Corporation in Saskatchewan (1988) suggest more positive employability improvement as a result of the programs. The Edmonton Goodwill Rehabilitation Service study reports that, at the time of the study, 80% of trainees were employed in jobs for which they were trained. Similarly, the follow-up study of New Careers Corporation clients (1990) indicated that two-thirds of former trainees were employed or in school at the time of the survey, and that these individuals were employed an average of 68% of the time since program completion. In the absence of a comparison group, however, it is difficult to attribute these successes to the program.

The 1995 evaluation of Alberta's Training on the Job Program indicated that the program has had considerable impacts in helping client find employment and in reducing their reliance on social assistance. At the time of the survey conducted for the study (from 3 to 18 months following participation), 68% of the worker clients were employed with either their host employer or with another firm. Not surprising, the evaluation found that post-program employment among workers was highest immediately following the program (almost 80%), and lowest from 9 to 18 months after their participation (about 25%). Moreover, the study reports that only 14% of the worker clients were unemployed and in receipt of social assistance at the time of the survey. This reduction in the number of clients receiving social assistance resulted in a total average savings of $477 in social assistance payments.

The study also concluded that the skills obtained by worker clients during their work/on the job training placement were found to be highly transferrable. Almost three-quarters of employers reported that the skills obtained by the workers could be used in positions with other firms in their area. Similarly, a number of workers reported learning generic job skills such as client/customer relations (32%) and better work habits/responsibilities (25%). In addition, over one-half of the host employers noted improvements in the self-confidence (59%), work habits (54%), and willingness to assume responsibility (51%) of worker participants.

The report on the Survey Results of the jobsOntario - Training Program (1995) indicated that over 80% of worker participants remained on the job with the host employer beyond the one year training

credit period. Moreover, one-half of the workers received a promotion after their training. Overall, 90% of the worker participants reported that the training they received was useful to them on a daily basis, while 78% rated the quality of the training plan to be very high or extremely high.

TABLE 1
SUMMARY OF METHODOLOGICAL APPROACHES OF STUDIES REVIEWED

Comparison Group Design	One Group Design (Clients Only)	Literature/File Reviews and Interviews	Process Evaluation
British Columbia ✓ Community Tourism Employment Training Program ✓ Environment Youth Corps Program ✓ Forest Enhancement Program ✓ British Columbia's Classroom Training Program ✓ Job Action Program ✓ Employment Opportunities Program British Columbia & New Brunswick ✓ Self-Sufficiency Project Alberta ✓ Office Skills Development Program ✓ Pre-employment Training Program[1] ✓ Target Program ✓ Employment Alternatives Program ✓ Athabasca Regional Career Services Quebec ✓ Rattrapage scolaire[1] ✓ Expérience de travail ✓ Services externes de main-d'oeuvre ✓ Programme d'aide à l'intégration en emploi ✓ Bon d'emploi plus[1] ✓ Programme stages en milieu de travail[1] Newfoundland ✓ Skills Assessment and Training Centre US ✓ New Jersey OJT ✓ Maine OJT ✓ Baltimore Options Program ✓ Job Corps Computer Assisted Instruction ✓ Seattle Income Maintenance Experiment ✓ Denver Income Maintenance Experiment ✓ Florida's Project Independence ✓ Project Redirection ✓ Job Corps ✓ JOBSTART ✓ Massachusetts ET ✓ California's GAIN Project ✓ Cook County WIN Demonstration Project ✓ Virginia ESP Project ✓ San Diego SWIM Project ✓ Arkansas WORK Program ✓ Louisville WIN Laboratory Experiment ✓ San Diego EPP/EWEP ✓ National Supported Work Demonstration projects ✓ West Virginia CWEP ✓ The JOBS Program ✓ Youth Incentive Entitlement Pilot Project ✓ Minnesota Family Investment Program ✓ Homemaker-Home Health Aide Demonstration Project ✓ Minority Female Single Parent Demonstration Project	Alberta ✓ Training on the Job ✓ Academic Upgrading Utilizing Computer Assisted Instruction ✓ Crossover Program ✓ Futures Program ✓ Contemporary Women Program ✓ YMCA Employment Preparation Support Services ✓ Life Skills Training Centre ✓ Workplace Support Pilot Project ✓ Career Training Program Saskatchewan ✓ New Careers Corporation Ontario ✓ JobsOntario	Alberta ✓ Edmonton Goodwill Rehabilitation Service ✓ Job Placement Services Program Saskatchewan ✓ Saskatchewan Skills Development Program ✓ Saskatchewan JOBS Program ✓ Saskatchewan Employment Development Program Ontario ✓ FUTURES ✓ Employment Opportunities Program Quebec ✓ Actions positives pour le travail et l'emploi	Alberta ✓ Integrated Training Pilot Project New Brunswick ✓ NB Works ✓ NB Job Corps Nova Scotia ✓ Nova Scotia Compass Program Newfoundland ✓ Student Work and Service Program

[1] Includes a major cost-benefit analysis component discussed in this section of the report. Quebec's Bon d'emploi plus program no longer exists.

Both worker and employer participants indicated that the training received by clients was a factor contributing to the worker's post-program success.

Employers reported that the actual cost to the firm of the training provided exceeded the amount of the training credit received. The majority of employers (63%) indicated, however, that the costs of the training were worth the benefits. Specific benefits cited included improved productivity (21%), more effective staff (20%), improved competitiveness (14%), improved identification of problems (12%), improved morale (12%), and reduced turnover (10%). In addition, 77% of the employers surveyed stated that they would continue to provide training after the credit period expires.

The 1994 evaluation of the Stages en milieu de travail (PSMT) program in Quebec revealed that 27% of PSMT participants have been successfully integrated into the labour market 19 months following program completion, compared to only 19% of non-participants. The evaluation also found that 87% of PSMT participants had moved off social assistance for at least some amount of time in the year following program participation versus 60% of comparison group members, and that 58% of PSMT clients had moved off social assistance permanently during that year, compared to 50% of non-participants.

The study also reported that PSMT has had a significant positive impact on the participants' rate of permanent employment after the completion of the program. Results of the evaluation indicate that 20% of PSMT participants had obtained permanent employment, while only 6% of non-participants held permanent positions. In addition, participants overall tended to find employment relatively more quickly than members of the comparison group (4.26 months versus 5.99 months), were employed for a longer duration following participation in the program (9.59 months versus 8.56 months), and were employed for a greater number of consecutive months (8.97 months versus 8.09 months).

The study determined that participants greatly benefit from the on-the-job training provided by the program, and that the skills acquired by participants during their participation are highly transferrable to other job opportunities. In addition, the PSMT was found to be more successful for women and for francophones.

The survey of employers indicated that 45% of the private sector companies participating in PSMT intended to hire the participant after program completion, and that 10% intended to continue to participate in the program. One-third of employers also reported that they would have hired another individual to fill the PSMT position had they not participated in the program.

Findings from the New Jersey OJT evaluation (1988) indicate that the employment of training participants was one to three percent lower than employment rates of comparison group members one and two years following participation.

While the results from the Maine OJT project (1988) suggest considerable employment gains for participants after the first and second years of the program (53% of the experimental group versus 43% of the control group were employed after the first year; and 50% of the experimental group compared to 43% of the control group after the second year), these employability improvements could not be attributed to program participation.

In addition, the New Jersey and Maine OJT program studies revealed statistically significant increases in the earnings of participants over those of the comparison groups. In contrast to the British Columbia evaluations, these results were attributed to participants' success in obtaining higher paying jobs.

New Jersey OJT program participants showed a modest but statistically significant decrease in welfare receipt one and two years following the training. In the Maine OJT program, participants experienced an immediate reduction in welfare receipt, but showed a 12% increase by the end of the third year. These results, however, were not attributed to the program.

3.1.1 Lessons Learned

Overall, mixed results were found with respect to on-the-job training programs. The evaluations of the three on-the-job training programs in British Columbia, as well as those in the U.S. do not indicate that these programs have led to long term decreases in dependence on income support. In British Columbia, it appears that the burden for providing financial assistance is merely shifted from social assistance to UI. In the United States, non-trainees fare as well or better than participants in terms of reducing welfare dependency.

On the other hand, evaluations of programs in Alberta, Saskatchewan, Quebec and Ontario suggest that these programs have successfully integrated social assistance recipients into the workforce. Moreover, the Training on the Job Program in Alberta and the PSMT in Quebec were found to have a significant impact on reducing the proportion of clients in receipt of social assistance. It is interesting to note, however, that, with the exception of the Quebec evaluation, the studies of these more "successful" programs did not utilize comparison group methodologies, but rather, relied solely on information obtained from participants and host employers.

Careful examination of the various types of approaches suggests that the success of on-the-job training programs depends, to a large extent, on the relevance of the position for which the participant is being trained. Training which is focussed on jobs which reflect future employment possibilities, and where the skills obtained are considered transferrable, rather than simple "make-work" projects tends to be more successful in terms of improving the employability of social assistance recipients.

Moreover, some of the studies have indicated that on-the-job training in the private sector has a larger impact on the employability of participants than does similar training in public sector organizations. This may suggest that more exposure to profit-driven environments may be beneficial to participants in terms of achieving an attitudinal or cultural shift along work ethic dimensions.

3.2 Results of Classroom Training

A 1992 evaluation shows that classroom training in British Columbia has had a slight impact on reducing dependency on social assistance. On average, participants experienced a two month reduction in income support that would not have occurred without the training. The studies found that Career Technical training had the most significant impact on these reductions (ranging from 15% to 20% over the comparison group). Vocational training was also successful, in that it appeared to reduce the proportion of individuals in receipt of social assistance by 10% to 15%. Conversely, Academic training had very limited effects on reducing welfare dependency. Moreover, participants in Basic Adult Education experienced no long term reduction in income support, and actually increased their reliance on income support in the first few months following the training.

The evaluation of the Academic Upgrading Program Utilizing Computer-Assisted Instruction in Alberta (1994) determined that an overall decrease in the number of trainees on social assistance could be attributed to program participation, with much of this decrease due to participants enrolling in further training programs.

Although based on a total sample size of only 106 (94 program completers and/or non-completers and 12 comparison group members), the evaluation of Alberta's Office Skills Development Program (1991) found that two-thirds of the clients who completed the program were employed at least six months following completion. Program completers were also found to exhibit more stable employment patterns and were more likely than those who left the program prematurely to have obtained full time permanent employment in the post-program period. Moreover, about 75% of the clients who completed the program reported that the training provided through the program contributed to their success in finding employment.

In general, employers stated that the skills of Office Skills Development participants were as good as, or better than those of their labour force competitors, but one-half of employers also indicated that more on-the-job training would be beneficial to worker participants.

Earnings from employment among workers who completed this program, however, were found to be only slightly higher than those who left the program prematurely, but who nevertheless found employment in the post-program period (from six months to two years following program completion). In addition, those who completed the program and who were unable to find employment were more likely to continue to receive social assistance than the unemployed individuals who left the program prematurely or who never enrolled in the program.

Overall, social assistance payments made to clients who completed this program were reduced by 33% six months following the program, compared to a 9% increase among those who left the program prematurely, and a 32% increase among individuals who were referred to the program but did not attend. Program completers did, however, receive more social assistance prior to the program than did those who left the program prematurely or those who never attended the program. The evaluation also found that worker clients who completed the program achieved financial self-sufficiency at a faster pace than non-completers (2.43 months versus 7.25 months, on average). The analysis of costs and benefits suggested that because 67% of those who completed the program achieved financial self-support, program benefits outweighed program costs, and that the payback period for the program was just over one year.

The Saskatchewan Skills Development Program evaluation (1985-86) found that while training led to an increase in the average monthly social assistance payments to participants, clients drew upon social assistance less frequently up to 40 months after the completion of the program than prior to participation. As a result, overall social assistance payments made to these individuals decreased. This result was found to hold true for all participants except for single parent women who drew upon social assistance equally before and after program completion. Consequently, the total amount of social assistance paid to these individuals increased after the training.

The study also found that women with higher education levels were more likely to achieve reductions in their proportion of time on social assistance. Furthermore, the evaluation estimates that a total of 15% of participants had completely left Saskatchewan's welfare rolls up to 40 months following the program as a result of the training received.

The evaluation of the Rattrapage scolaire (PRS) program conducted in 1994 found that PRS participants showed a greater dependency on social assistance compared to clients of other similar programs in Quebec. Overall, only 20% of PRS participants obtained a job in the first 19 months following their completion of the program. Moreover, no significant differences were found between participants and non-participants in terms of moving off social assistance 19 months after the program. The study indicated, however, that a higher proportion of PRS clients (17%) than non-participants (7%) found permanent employment up to 12 months following program completion. Although job search duration was, on average, virtually equal for participants and non-participants (5.59 compared to 5.57 months), participants tended to be employed for a slightly greater number of months than non-participants (8.89 versus 8.57 months) and for a slightly greater number of consecutive months (8.36 months for participants and 8.07 months for non-participants).

The study also suggested that the program has had a greater impact on clients born outside of Canada. Another 1991 study of PRS, however, indicated that the program was particularly effective for individuals whose mother tongue is neither French nor English, and for participants who have obtained a grade 9 to 11 education level.

The cost-benefit analysis estimated that the costs incurred as a result of this program far outweighed the financial benefits accrued, resulting in an overall net loss. However, when broken down by type of recipient, the benefits of the PRS program were found to exceed the costs for recipients who do not have children, as well as for male clients.

The evaluation of the Student Work and Service Program in Newfoundland (1995) determined that for social assistance recipients, the program is a cost-effective approach to encouraging academic pursuits. In addition, among social assistance recipients currently attending school via the program, one-third indicated that they would not have enrolled in the absence of the program.

No statistically significant differences were found between participants and comparison group members in terms of reducing welfare dependency as a result of participation in the Baltimore Options program. However, the evaluation (1985-87) estimates that as a result of participation, annual earnings for income support recipients improved (albeit small numerically) at an increasing rate by an average of $140 in the first year to $511 in the third year of participation. The program did not have significant impacts on the employability of its participants.

The Job Corps Computer Assisted Instruction evaluation (1987) found no impacts of the

program on the educational attainment of participants, with the exception of a moderate increase in attendance in GED classes. This study did not endeavour to measure the effects of the program on earnings, employability and welfare dependency.

The evaluation of the Seattle and Denver Income Maintenance Experiments (1986) discovered that the projects had considerable impacts in increasing educational activities of its participants for up to six years following enrolment into the programs. However, the study did not reveal any consistent program impacts on earnings and employability. In fact, in some cases, the study found that certain groups of participants experienced decreases in their earnings and labour market activity during the six year duration of the follow-up period.

The 1984 study of the Minority Female Single Parent Demonstration Project (MFSP) revealed that 12 months after enrolment into the program, one site -- the Centre for Employment Training (CET) in northern California (the only site of the four MFSP sites identified in the document reviewed) -- showed large positive impacts on the employment rates, hours worked, wage rates, and earnings of participants (the specific levels of these outcome measures were not provided in the document reviewed). In the remaining three sites, no significant differences were found between program and control group members in employment and earning levels. The study also indicated that MFSP participants experienced significant gains in attaining their GEDs in all four sites. Again, however, the document reviewed did not provide the actual levels or proportions of participants having attained their GED.

The study of the Homemaker-Home Health Aide Demonstration (1986), delivered in seven states (Arkansas, Kentucky, New Jersey, New York, Ohio, South Carolina, and Texas) found that during the third year of participation, the program led to significant increases in unsubsidized employment among participants in Arkansas (19 percentage point difference in employment between participants and the control group); New Jersey (11 percentage point difference in employment between participants and the control group); Ohio (11 percentage point difference in employment between participants and the control group); and Texas (21 percentage point difference in employment between participants and the control group).

The program was also found to have significant positive impacts on the average annual earnings of participants compared to those of the control group. By the third year of participation, program clients were earning $1,116 per year more than the control group in Arkansas, $1,860 per year more than the control group in Kentucky, $1,344 per year more than the control group in New Jersey, $1,212 per year more than the control group in Ohio, and $1,944 per year more than the control group in Texas.

In addition, the Homemaker-Home Health Aide Demonstration was found to significantly reduce the average combined annual welfare and food stamp benefits made to participants. In Arkansas, for instance, by the third year of participation, the average annual combined welfare and food stamp benefits was $540 less for the experimental group than it was for the control group. Similarly, in Kentucky, by the third year of participation, the average annual combined welfare and food stamp benefits was $432 lower for the experimental group than it was for the control group. Ohio participants experienced a $564 average reduction in the annual combined welfare and food stamp benefits by the third year of participation compared to the control group. In South Carolina, the average reduction in combined welfare and food stamps benefits for program clients by the end of the third

year of participation was $1,008 more than that of the control group. It should be noted that program and control group means for employment, earnings, and reductions in welfare and food stamps benefits were not provided in the report reviewed.

3.2.1 Lessons Learned

The results of the evaluations reviewed for this study revealed that classroom training in Canada, while reducing the proportion of time a participant receives social assistance, has also, in some cases, led to increased monthly welfare benefits among trainees. This may be due to clients' potential eligibility for supplementary subsidies such as daycare or transportation. In many cases, the end result has been a financial zero-sum gain.

These studies also suggest, however, that reduced social assistance dependency may be a function of the fact that training participants are seeking and receiving alternate forms of financial assistance related to their education, such as grants and bursaries, and are in essence, simply transferring the means of support from one source to another.

As a result, based on the evaluations conducted to date in Canada, it does not appear that classroom training is an effective vehicle for integrating social assistance recipients into the workforce.

In the U.S., evaluations studying the impacts of classroom training on participants revealed no consistent findings in terms of employability, earnings, or social assistance receipt levels. Clients were found to have improved their employability and earnings, and reduced their social assistance dependency in fewer than one half of the programs reviewed. Moreover, these inconsistencies were found across classroom training sites within the same programs.

There is some evidence, however, that classroom training in both Canada and in the U.S., which is more vocational in nature achieves the best results in terms of integrating social assistance recipients into the workforce. Some of the studies reviewed indicated that training geared towards a specific occupation or occupational category (e.g., computers, office skills, etc.) have had positive implications for reducing dependency on social assistance and for achieving financial self-sufficiency among clients.

In terms of encouraging social assistance recipients to pursue education and training, the voucher and grant systems implemented in many programs have been conducive to increasing enrollment and attendance in classroom training. From this perspective, these programs have been successful in achieving objectives in the short run, however, the long term impacts are unknown.

3.3 Results of Pre-Employment Training Programs

The evaluation of Alberta's Pre-employment Training Program (1992-93) indicated that the program had a significant impact on the employability of participants. Nearly 30% of program clients surveyed were employed full time one year following their participation, compared to only 20% of comparison group members. The evaluation also found that while close to 50% of the comparison group was not employed either full or part time in the post-program period, fewer than 40% of the clients had not obtained full or part time employment in the 12 months following participation. Overall, 22% more participants were employed one year following the program than prior to it, versus only 8% for comparison group members.

Comparing the effectiveness of the program across its various sites, the evaluation estimated that the most successful programs had established strong linkages with the workplace and with employers, offered a program component which focussed on specific skills, were smaller (i.e., fewer clients) but longer in length, and concentrated on participant follow-up.

The study estimated that the average decrease in social assistance payments which can be attributed to program participation was $22 per month. Given these reductions, the evaluation estimated that the cost-benefit payback period for the overall program was 3.5 years. The overall program cost-benefit analysis, however, only considered the reduced social assistance payments, and did not incorporate many other benefits which are difficult to measure. It also did not consider the opportunity costs of not providing specialized training programs to social assistance recipients over the longer term.

A separate cost-benefit study was completed in 1993 for four programs under the Pre-employment Training Program. The Individual Action Planning Program and the Life Skills and Pre-Employment Program provided by Strathcona College Inc., the Employability Enhancement Program offered through Concordia College, and the Options for Adults Program of the Edmonton YMCA.

The cost-benefit analysis of the Individual Action Planning Program estimated that, from an overall social perspective, the net present value of the program during the study period (April 1991 to March 1992) was almost $2 Million, for an internal rate of return after two years of 159%. Given this, it was estimated that the program paid for itself in only four months. From a provincial government perspective, however, because the program was found to increase social assistance payments and subsidies for day care and transportation made to clients during their participation, the study concluded that the net present value was -$1 Million. Moreover, the net present value of benefits associated with the participants of the Individual Action Planning was nearly $2.5 Million, while employers were found to benefit from increased productivity at a level corresponding to a net present value of $.35 Million.

The cost-benefit analysis of the Life Skills and Pre-Employment Program conducted from society's perspective revealed that the program resulted in a net loss of approximately $.16 Million during the study period (April 1991 to October 1992). The incremental earnings attributed to the program were not sufficiently high to offset the initial investment and operating costs associated with the program. Similarly, the net present value of the Life Skills and Pre-Employment Program to the provincial government during the period of the study was -$.3 Million. This loss was attributed in part to the increase

in total social assistance payments made to clients during program participation. The analysis did determine, however, overall marginal gains to participants and employers over the 18 month period of $70,000 and $8,000, respectively.

The results of the cost-benefit analysis performed with respect to the Employability Enhancement Program found that, from a broad social perspective, the program yields benefits which are greater than costs. The analysis estimated that the net present value of the program was $.9 Million during the two year study period (October 1991 to October 1993). It was also estimated that the program would pay for itself after 13 months. From a provincial government perspective, however, the program was found to yield a net present value of -$1.2 Million. This negative net present value was estimated to come from higher social assistance payments made to clients, the fact that more participants were working part time and thus still eligible for social assistance, clients shifting the burden of income support from UI to social assistance, as well as increases in post-training daycare and transportation subsidies. The costs and benefits associated with the program from the participant's perspective revealed an extremely positive net gain of $1.7 Million over the two years. Similarly, the study estimated that the net present value of the program from the employer's standpoint was $.19 Million.

The analysis of the Options for Adults Program estimated that from society's perspective, the net present value of the program during the study period (April 1991 to June 1992) was $1.4 Million, with an internal rate of return of at the end of the 18 months of 93%. Moreover, from this perspective, the payback period for the program is 8 months. In terms of the provincial government, however, the study estimated a net present value of -$1.1 Million, attributed to the increases in social assistance payments, the fact that more participants were working part time and thus still eligible for social assistance, clients shifting the burden of income support from UI to social assistance, and day care and transportation subsidies to clients after the training. The results of the analysis from the participant and employer perspectives were found to be positive. Specifically, the net present value of the program to worker clients was reported to be over $2 Million, while the net present value to employers was estimated at $.25 Million.

The evaluation of Alberta's Target Program (1993) reported that six months following their intake into the program, 20% of the participants had obtained full time employment, and 8% held part time positions. Prior to the program, only 5% of the total sample of participants were employed, and each of these individuals was employed part time. Moreover, another 10% of clients were enrolled in educational or training programs six months following participation in the Target Program, compared to only 3% prior to participation. Following their participation, the proportion of clients considered not employed but available for work decreased from 80% to 42%. Among individuals who found employment, 45% did so in positions requiring unskilled labour, 25% in skilled labour, 15% in clerical and 15% in other positions.

Six months following the program, the average monthly earnings from employment of the entire sample of participants was $171. When only those participants who had found employment are considered, the average monthly salary of post-program participants increases to $728.

Overall, 27% of the client sample had left the program prematurely by the sixth week of its 18 week duration. The evaluation indicated that a higher proportion (55%) of non-completers than of those who completed the program were classified by program staff as unemployed but available for work, while 12% more complet-

ers than those who left prematurely were employed six months after their participation.

No statistically significant impacts were found with respect to social assistance receipt as a result of leaving the program early. However, the average monthly social assistance payment made to clients who left the program prematurely was $610, compared to only $384 among those who completed the program.

When compared to a sample of social assistance recipients with similar backgrounds, but who had not participated in the Target Program, the evaluation found that a slightly higher proportion of clients found either full or part time employment as a result of their participation (30% versus 24%), with 21% of the program group finding full time employment compared to only 12% of the comparison group. No statistically significant differences between the program and comparison groups were found in terms of earnings and social assistance dependency. With respect to the average monthly social assistance payment, however, the evaluation reported statistically significant differences between program clients and non-participants. Clients had reduced their monthly payment by an average of $230, compared to an average of $213 among non-participants.

Although only based on a small sample of 52 clients who had completed the program, the evaluation of the Crossover Program (1993) found that 73% had obtained employment or enrolled in further education and training following their participation. Among the 22 clients (42%) who found employment, 7 (32%) reported that they would have obtained work in the absence of the program, and 5 (23%) were unsure as to whether or not they would have found a job without the help of the Crossover Program. In addition,. almost one-half of the program completers (25) had reduced their levels of social assistance support by 20% or more for a period of up to 52 weeks.

In terms of program management and delivery, the evaluation reported that the individual needs of clients were not well understood or adequately assessed. The program's focus on helping clients find employment or pursue training opportunities took priority over identifying and responding to the specific needs of participants. The action plans developed for the clients tended to be similar for each participant rather than reflecting their individual needs. Moreover, the study reported that the life skills component of the program did not effectively deal with the employment barriers and/or personal problems faced by participants.

The survey results of Alberta's Futures Program (1992) suggested that 30% of the participants were employed six months following program completion, the majority of which (55%) were employed in part time positions. The evaluation also found that 15% of the participants had enrolled in a training or academic upgrading program up to six months after the completion of the Futures Program. Overall, the combination of clients having found employment and/or pursued further training was estimated to be 44%. The evaluation reported that compared to the 60% employment and/or training rates observed in previous studies of similar programs, this evaluation concluded that the program had not attained an adequate level of success.

3.3.1 Lessons Learned

The results of studies on Pre-employment Training Programs indicate that this type of service has been only moderately effective in integrating social assistance recipients into the workforce. Overall, while a higher proportion of participants of pre-employment training programs were found to obtain full time employment than were non-participants, fewer than one-third of the participants actually found jobs following the training. Similarly, although these programs were found to

lead to improvements in the educational attainment of clients compared to non-participants, only about one-eighth of overall pre-employment training participants pursued further education and training. In addition, pre-employment training programs have met with only marginal success with respect to reducing social assistance payments made to participants. Since many participants were found to obtain part time employment and thus retain their social assistance benefits or were found to shift the burden of income support from UI to social assistance, these programs were found not to be cost-effective means of integrating social assistance recipients into the labour market from a provincial government budget perspective.

3.4 Results of Life Skills Training Programs

In terms of life skills training, the Process Evaluation of the Integrated Training Pilot Project in Alberta (1995) found several problems relating to program delivery. First, given the nature of the training received, it is often difficult for participants to envision a "clearly identified job" at program completion. The evaluation also discovered that many delivery agents face considerable challenges in the client screening process, and have experienced difficulties assessing the extent to which applicants are appropriate for the program. In addition, many clients themselves appear to be experiencing difficulties in treating the program as they would treat work. More tolerant policies regarding absenteeism, tardiness, personal grooming, and dress codes have had negative implications for simulating an actual work environment. The evaluation attributes the fact that many clients are not job-ready at the completion of the training to these factors.

The Contemporary Women Program in Alberta (1994) appears to have had a positive impact on encouraging social assistance recipients to enter the workforce or to pursue educational and training programs. A total of 85% of program participants (based on a sample size of only 57) were either working or attending school from 3 months to one year following program completion, with 49% having found employment. Similarly, 80% of participants (based on only 73 cases) in the YWCA Employment Preparation Support Program (1994) had either found work or were attending or waiting to begin training from 3 months to one year following program completion. In this case, however, only 31% had actually secured employment. While not as successful as the above two programs, the Life Skills Training Centres program (1994) was found to have a 65% rate of employment or training from 3 months to one year following program completion (based on a sample size of only 134).

The evaluation of these three programs also indicated a fairly high success rate in terms of reducing participants' reliance on social assistance. Overall, over two-thirds of participants were either partially or completely off social assistance from 3 months to one year following program completion. Specifically, 53% of YWCA Employment Preparation Support Program participants had completely moved off income support, and nearly one-half of participants in the remaining two programs no longer required income support.

The evaluation of the life skills training component of Florida's Project Independence (1994) did not find significant impacts on earnings or welfare reductions among participants. The evaluation cautions, however, that because these are only preliminary findings, there may not be enough evidence to make conclusions about the effectiveness of program activities on the outcomes of its participants.

The evaluation of Project Redirection in the U.S.(1985) estimated that while the program increased short-term secondary school retention rates, there were no significant differences in the longer term educational attainment between program and comparison group members. Through a five year follow-up study, the evaluation identified a number of impacts resulting from program participation. These include an average increase in the weekly earnings of participants of almost $40, and a 12% decrease in the number of participants in receipt of welfare.

The U.S. Job Corps evaluation (1982) found that over 40% of participants obtained secondary school diplomas as a result of the program up to 54 months following enrolment into the program, versus only 6% of comparison group members. The study also discovered, however, that female participants with children experienced consistently lower post-program earnings and employment levels than did adults without children in the 54 month duration of the follow-up period.

While not as successful as the Jobs Corps program, JOBSTART (1985) also had an impact in encouraging the completion of secondary studies among participants (28% of trainees versus 19% of comparison group members). This program was particularly effective for females with children.

3.4.1 Lessons Learned

Life skills training appears to be most effective when focussed on specific target groups, particularly for women. Evaluations in both Canada and the United States found that this type of training had positive implications for increasing employability and reducing reliance on income support. A more focussed selection of participants can also help alleviate some of the problems associated with screening appropriate clients, although this has been perceived as "creaming" in order to achieve greater program results.

3.5 Results of Job Search Assistance Programs

The evaluation conducted for the Job Action Program in British Columbia (1992) showed that, in the short run, this job search assistance program helped reduce the number of participants in receipt of social assistance. In the long run, however, participants tended to gravitate back to income support. This return to the welfare rolls was attributed to the fact that participants find employment more rapidly as a result of the program, but may be accepting work which is inappropriate for them, causing them to quit prematurely. There was no evidence that the program led to employability or wage gains.

Evaluations of job search assistance program in the U.S. found that, with the exception of the Cook County WIN Demonstration project (1987), programs are effective in producing increases in earnings and decreases in welfare receipt. Average annual earnings increases attributable to these programs ranged from a low of $69 for the first year of participation in the Virginia ESP project (1988), to a high of $658 in the second year of participation in the San Diego SWIM program (1989). Similarly, welfare payments to participants were reduced by as much as 19% over comparison group members in the second year of participation in the Arkansas WORK program (1988).

Specifically, the evaluations of the Arkansas WORK program, the individual job search component of the Louisville WIN Laboratory Experiment (1981), the job search component of the San Diego SWIM program, and the Virginia ESP reported that these programs produced increased employment and earnings among participants,

as well as reductions in welfare receipt and payments for up to three years following enrolment into each respective program. While the group job search component of the Louisville WIN Laboratory Experiment also helped increase the earnings and employability of participants in the three years following enrolment into the program, it did not appear to have an impact on welfare reduction.

The San Diego EPP/EWEP study (1980), which tracked participants for one year after enrolment, reported that job search assistance impacts on earnings and employability were inconsistent among participants, but that a short term reduction in welfare receipt was discovered.

Florida's Project Independence appears to have achieved positive first year impacts in terms of increasing earnings and employability, and reducing welfare receipt. The 1994 study indicates that the program produced an increase in the earnings of participants which is, on average, 7% higher than that of the comparison group. Moreover, the study estimated that as a result of their participation, 5% more clients than comparison group members found employment. In addition, the project resulted in a 7% reduction in welfare payments, and a 6% decrease in the number of clients in receipt of income assistance.

3.5.1 Lessons Learned

There is some indication of short run benefits of job search assistance programs in terms of reducing participant reliance on income support, such as social assistance or UI. However, these benefits were found to be short lived. Even though the U.S. experience has been much more encouraging, there remains some evidence of longer term returns to welfare. It has been suggested that the renewed reliance on income support is a function of the acquisition of inappropriate or temporary employment.

3.6 Results of Work Experience Programs

A 1993 evaluation of Quebec's Expérience de travail (EXTRA) program found that while the program does not lead to significant impacts in terms of finding employment overall, a significant difference exists between participants and non-participants with respect to obtaining permanent employment (12% and 6%, respectively). The evaluation also reported that 74% of the participants who found employment had moved off social assistance 19 months following their participation in EXTRA, with 53% of employed clients doing so permanently. Following their participation, EXTRA clients appear to take less time on average to find employment (5.34 months) than do non-participants (6.4 months), and work for a somewhat greater number of consecutive months than the members of the comparison group (7.55 months versus 7.98 months).

Another study (1992) included an examination of EXTRA. With respect to EXTRA, it found that 40% of the not-for-profit organizations surveyed confirmed that the tasks completed by the participants would not have been reassigned to other workers in the absence of the program. Furthermore, 20% of the employers surveyed reported that they intended to retain the participant after the work placement, while 62% indicated that they would continue to use the program with other eligible worker clients.

The evaluation of the Services externes de main-d'oeuvre (SEMO) program found that, because its target clients face severe employment disadvantages (e.g., physical and mental disabilities, violence/alcohol/ drug/family related problems, behavioral

problems, etc.) only 37% of the participants successfully found employment in the first 19 months after program completion, with only 9% obtaining permanent work. Moreover, while non-participants were found to find employment which approaches those rates of SEMO clients, 9% found permanent jobs. The evaluation also found that 80% of participants who found employment had moved off social assistance at some point during the 19 month post-program measurement period, compared to only 63% of non-participants. No significant differences were found between participants and non-participants in terms of permanently moving off social assistance. While participants spent slightly less time on average to find employment after the program than non-participants (6.10 months compared to 6.28 months), they tended to work for a greater number of consecutive months than members of the comparison group (9.05 months versus 7.49 months) in the 19 month post-program period.

The National Supported Work Demonstration Project (1985) in the US was targeted at severely disadvantaged welfare recipients averaging more than 8.5 years on social assistance. The evaluation of the project revealed that participation in the program led to increases in earnings and reductions in welfare receipt. During the third year after enrollment into the program, participants earned an average of 23% more than members of the comparison group ($5,799 versus $4,703). Similarly, by year three, while 64% of participants were still receiving welfare benefits, 71% of the comparison were still on welfare. Moreover, the program appears to have had a significant impact on reducing welfare payments made to participants. The evaluation found that, after the third year of participation in the program, clients received an average of $3,501 in social assistance benefits, compared to $3,902 among non-participants. This represents approximately a 10% reduction.

The study estimated that in the first year after enrollment into the program, 73% of the participants were employed, while only 30% of comparison group members had obtained jobs. This immediate gain in employability among participants (141% increase) was short lived, however, as no statistically significant differences in employment of participants versus non-participants were found at the end of the second and third years.

The West Virginia Community Work Experience Program was a mandatory work experience program which covered a broad base of social assistance recipients. The evaluation of the program (1986) compared the earnings,. employment, and welfare receipt and payments of participants one year after enrollment into the program to those of non-participants. No statistically significant differences were found in any of these indicators between the two groups.

3.6.1 Lessons Learned

The review of the literature indicates that work experience programs have been a viable tool for social assistance recipients who face systematic difficulties in terms of long run labour market integration (e.g., severely disadvantaged, persons with disabilities, older workers, single parents, etc.). The four studies reviewed which assessed the effectiveness of these types of programs found that, in the long run, participants of work experience programs targeted at social assistance recipients with more severe labour market barriers experienced gains in short run employment, earnings, and job retention, while reducing their dependence on social assistance. Moreover, the broad-based coverage work experience programs reviewed for this study were found to have no significant impacts on earnings, employability, or

welfare dependency of participants.

3.7 Results of Wage Subsidies

The 1992 evaluation of British Columbia's Employment Opportunities Program (EOP) found that the program had considerable impacts on reducing the welfare dependency of social assistance recipients. After only three months of participation, one-half of the program clients had moved off social assistance, compared to only one-fifth of the comparison group members. Moreover, at the seven month mark, 10 to 15% more participants than comparison group members had not returned to social assistance, and this trend appears to have continued in the longer term (beyond two years). There was, however, evidence that the program led to greater utilization of UI. From 18 to 36 months following enrolment into the program, 5 to 10% more clients than non-clients were collecting UI benefits.

EOP also appeared to result in considerable employment gains for its participants. The evaluation estimated that 11% more clients were employed one year after program completion than they would have been in the absence of the program. The study did not reveal, however, that the program had an impact in raising the wages of participants. Rather, it found that post-program wages of clients approximated those of comparison group members. One possible explanation for this is that the program created new low wage jobs for some clients, while raising the wages for others. Consequently, the net effect would have been an average earnings change which was insignificant.

The program appeared to have a greater impact on older workers, as well as on longer-term recipients. Moreover, single parents showed a reduced probability of achieving employment and earnings gains as a result of program participation, but there was a greater reduction in social assistance payments among those whose employability and earnings did improve.

The findings from the evaluation of Alberta's Employment Alternatives Program (1990) suggest that participation had a positive impact on increasing the proportion of time spent working in the post-period (up to 12 months following program completion). On average, the program resulted in a 1.6 to 3.2 month increase in the time spent employed for these individuals. Moreover, the study reports that about 5% more participants than comparison group members were employed up to 12 months following the completion of the program.

The evaluation concluded that the earnings of participants up to 12 months after the completion of the program were lower than those of comparison group members (17% of participants were found to earn less than $200 per week versus only 10% of the comparison group, and 33% of participants earned over $350 compared to 51% of non-participants). However, it did find that 1988 program clients experienced an average increase in their earnings (from $12,437 to $15,010) while non-participants experienced an average loss (from $17,119 to $16,907).

The program was not found to have had a significant impact on reducing reliance on social assistance . Up to one year following program participation, a similar proportion of clients as non-participants continued to receive welfare benefits. The study identified, however, that the average reduction in social assistance payments to participants up to 12 months following program completion was more than $150 per month, but did not make any claims that this reduction was a result of the program.

The evaluation of the Saskatchewan JOBS Program (1984), which was primarily a descriptive study not intended to

assess the long term implications of the program, found that a considerably high proportion of participants did not complete the program (54%). Ironically, the study also identified a fairly high level of satisfaction with the program among employers and employees. According to employers, only about 20% of worker clients who left the program reported doing so for higher paying employment opportunities, while 22% were released by the employer. Overall, employers estimated that 20% of the jobs created through the wage subsidies would continue after program completion.

In contrast, the participant non-completion rate in the Saskatchewan Employment Development Program (1985) was found to be 37%, with 68% of those leaving doing so for "valid" reasons.

This study, which was conducted to estimate short-term program success from the employer perspective, concluded that the majority of host employers were satisfied with the quality of the work completed by the worker participant, and that this work had lasting benefits for the organization. Moreover, employers generally reported that their needs were satisfied and that their program goals had been met as a result of their participation.

While the program is no longer in existence, the cost-benefit analysis of Quebec's Bon d'emploi plus (BEP) conducted in 1991 indicated that as a result of the significant reductions in welfare receipt among program clients compared to other welfare to work programs, this program was estimated to have a higher net benefit relative to Quebec's PRS, PSMT and EXTRA programs. Net benefits were found to be greatest for clients who had participated in the program for more than three years, participants without children, women, and those with at least a grade 11 education.

The 1994 evaluation of Quebec's Program d'aide à l'intégration en emploi (PAIE) found that the program has had a significant impact on helping participants find permanent employment. Overall, 55% of PAIE clients who found a job in the 19 months following their participation obtained permanent jobs, while only 7% of comparison group members who found employment during the same period obtained permanent work. PAIE participants were also found, on average, to find employment at a faster pace (3.88 months following participation) than non-participants (6 months), and to work a greater number of months in the first 19 months after participation than their comparison group counterparts (10.9 versus 8.3 months). Moreover, the study estimated that program clients who found at least one job in the 19 month follow-up period have a 63% likelihood of permanently moving off social assistance, compared to only 49% of non-participants.

As noted in chapter 2, approximately 60% of NB Job Corps participants are social assistance recipients. The 1995 process evaluation revealed a fairly high retention rate among its clients. Of the total of the 1,119 participants having enrolled in the project as of September 1995, only 121 (11%) had exited. In addition, it was found that 85% of active participants have remained with their original host employer over the course of their participation. Moreover, based on the participants' backgrounds, skills and experiences, and the types of projects funded under NB Jobs Corps, the evaluation concluded that the project generally provided a good match between the types of placement and the characteristics of clients.

Overall, the evaluation reported that the selection and recruiting procedures for host employers and participants is generally working well and efficiently. The report indicated that, with the exception of rural areas where recruiting has proven to be more difficult than

anticipated, no shortages of participants were found in any region of the province. Some more rural and less populated areas, however, initially experienced challenges in generating sufficient projects in which to place participants. These cases generally reflected the variations in the distribution of resources in the province, as well as the regional employment rates.

Of the 200 host employers surveyed for the evaluation, 57 stated that their operations improved as a result of the inclusion of NB Job Corps participants; 28 recognized and appreciated the skills and experience which the participants brought to the project; and 10 reported that the project provided economic and environmental benefits to the community. A total of 54 host employers reported some disadvantages with the project, including that the participant was less qualified than originally expected, difficulties in providing adequate supervision, poor timing of the placement with respect to operational needs, and participant attendance problems.

The most frequently cited reasons for participating in NB Job Corps among employers were the opportunity to acquire free labour (48%), and the chance to recover from previous budget cuts affecting human resources in their organization (38%). Other reasons mentioned include the potential benefits for participants (13%), the opportunity to create jobs (11%), and the potential for accessing skilled and experienced individuals (10%). The most commonly mentioned benefit of participation among employers was the addition of human resources to the organization (27%). In addition, 19% stated that they were able to provide improved customer service, 17% stated that they benefitted from the additional work completed by the participants, and 15% reported the free labour advantage.

The survey of worker participants conducted for the evaluation revealed that the most frequently cited reasons for participating in NB Job Corps were related to employment and earnings. Overall, 32% of participants reported that they enrolled in the project to obtain employment and 14% stated that their reason for participating was to return to employment. In addition, the opportunity to earn income and to terminate their involvement with social assistance were each mentioned by 10% of the survey respondents.

The project benefits, as identified by worker clients, included that the project offered them the opportunity to work, that they enjoyed the work and the camaraderie within the workplace, that the project provided them with new challenges and opportunities to expand their skills, and that they were able to develop a stronger work ethic and motivation for working as a result of their participation. Moreover, based on survey responses, the evaluation estimated that, had they not been offered placements, 43% of participants would have remained on social assistance, while 13% would have done nothing.

Overall, 93% of the participants reported that they were very or somewhat satisfied with the placement provided. Lower levels of satisfaction were found to be associated with placements which require physically demanding work, or work completed in more challenging climatic conditions. Although 56% of clients stated that they did not feel that the placements provided were directly related to their previous work experience, their general perception of the projects are that they make significant contributions to improving the quality of the environment as well as the overall quality of life of participants.

The evaluation of the Youth Incentive Entitlement Pilot Projects (1984) in the U.S. estimated the impacts of the program on employability,

earnings and educational attainment of clients in demonstration sites (in Baltimore, Maryland; Denver, Colorado; Cincinnati, Ohio; and eight of the 19 rural counties in Mississippi) in relation to comparison sites (in Cleveland, Ohio; Phoenix, Arizona; Louisville, Kentucky; and six of the 19 rural counties in Mississippi). The study focussed primarily on black youth (15 and 16 years old upon entering the program), as this sub-sample had the highest program participation rate (73%) and were considered the most disadvantaged group of participants.

The evaluation found that during the period of program participation, in which access to guaranteed subsidized employment was available to clients, the projects led to a 68% improvement in the employment rates of the overall sample of participants over that of the comparison group (participants and control group members were tracked over two full school years and three summers). This represented an 88% increase during the school year, and a 38% increase during the summer months over non-participant rates of employment. The study estimated that the program increased the rate of youth employment from 22% in comparison sites to 40% in test sites by the end of the second school year.

In terms of the young black sub-sample, during three years of participation, the program led to increases in average weekly earnings of participants over comparison group members of about $10 during the school year, and $13 during the summer. In addition, post-program earnings of the client group were about 40% higher than those of the comparison group, representing a difference of almost $11 per week.

The findings also suggest, however, that many individuals in this sub-sample would have remained in school (one of the conditions of accepting the guaranteed job) in the absence of the program. The data indicate that no significant differences existed between program and comparison group members in terms of secondary school enrollment, graduation and non-completion rates. Nevertheless, the study concluded that the program had positive benefits for enhancing future labour market success for in-school youth who would not have remained employed without the job guarantees offered through these pilot projects.

3.7.1 Lessons Learned

The review of the studies conducted to evaluate the impacts of wage subsidy programs indicate that these types of programs can lead to employability gains for social assistance recipients. A higher proportion of program clients in British Columbia and in the U.S. were found to be employed following program participation than were comparison group members. In Alberta's Employment Alternatives Program, program participants were found to be employed a greater proportion of the time following the program than were the general population of social assistance recipients. In Quebec's PAIE wage subsidy program, participants who found work were more likely to find permanent employment than were non-participants.

The evaluations of the EOP Program in British Columbia and the Employment Alternatives Program in Alberta reveal, however, that many of the program participants have obtained lower-paying jobs than they would have in the absence of the program. This suggests that, as a result of the wage subsidy programs, some participants develop a certain level of tolerance and flexibility in terms of the type of employment they are willing to accept, and that they would rather accept a low paying job than rely on income support to meet their financial needs.

On the other hand, the EOP evaluation also found that program participants are

increasing their reliance on UI following program participation. Given this, and the Saskatchewan experience with high non-completion rates among wage subsidy participants, it may be that certain clients are participating in wage subsidy programs merely to qualify for UI benefits, thus shifting the burden of income support from one source to another. However, in the absence of any concrete reasons for the participants' high non-completion rates, it is difficult to confirm this possibility.

Some findings also suggest that the level of job-readiness may be a factor in improving employability and earnings among participants in wage subsidy programs. The British Columbia evaluation suggests that more experienced participants tend to secure more pronounced benefits than their counterparts with less extensive labour market histories. As well, Quebec's BEP and the U.S. experiment showed significant earnings and employment gains for participants as they increased their levels of education and work experience.

3.8 Results of Earnings Supplements

The 1995 report of the 18 month findings of the Self-Sufficiency Project (SSP) estimates that the project has had a significant impact in increasing the employability of participants which is 43% higher than non-participants. Overall, almost 41% of the program group were working 15 months following enrollment into the program, compared to 28% of comparison group members. The vast majority of this difference was found to be due to participants finding full time, rather than part time employment. The study also determined that about 40% of the individuals who found work would have done so without the program's financial incentives.

Program participants were found to earn an average of $137 per month more than comparison group members as a result of the program. Evaluators also found that participants worked an average of 20 hours per month more than non-participants. Given this, the report estimated that participants are accepting relatively low paying employment at or just beyond minimum wage levels.

In terms of reductions in social assistance, the study revealed that 14% fewer participants than members of the comparison group were receiving social assistance payments. This translates into a $117 average lower amount of social assistance payments made to clients versus that of the comparison group, resulting from program participation ($655 and $772, respectively). By the fifth quarter, however, the study found that the total payment for social assistance and income supplements made to program clients was an average of $94 per month in excess of the social assistance payments made to non-participants.

Regardless of this longer term increase, the evaluation suggested that its anti-poverty objective was being achieved. In the fifth quarter, members of the program group were receiving (from all sources) an average of $235 per month more than their comparison group counterparts. This represents a 23% gain in total earnings and benefits over non-participants.

In the U.S., Minnesota's Family Investment Program (MFIP) provides earnings supplements to single and two- parent family social assistance recipients by reducing current earnings exemptions among participants. The evaluation of MFIP (1995) reported that after six months, single parent participants were significantly more likely to have

reported receiving some earnings from employment than were non-participants. This impact was particularly significant for longer-term welfare recipients. After nine months of program participation, approximately one-third of single parent participants reported receiving some employment income, compared to only 10% of the control group. Overall, however, a greater proportion of control group members completely moved off social assistance than did program participants (18% versus 14%).

In terms of two-parent family social assistance recipients, program group members were 16% more likely to mix work and welfare than were non-participants, but 12% more control group members than participants had left welfare altogether.

This study also found that at the six month mark, the average welfare payment received by single parent welfare recipients in the program group was $53 greater than those received by non-participants. These impacts, however, varied among different sub-groups. For instance, longer term social assistance recipients in the program group received welfare payments which exceeded those of the comparison group by an average of $50 in the first six months. By the ninth month, however, no differences were found in welfare payments between the two groups. Conversely, two-parent family social assistance recipients showed continued increases in welfare payments to program participants equal to an average of $166.

3.8.1 Lessons Learned

The early findings of the evaluations of SSP and MFIP indicate that, over the short term, these earnings supplement programs have resulted in greater labour market activity for social assistance recipients. Moreover, in the short run overall income from all work and welfare sources among SSP participants appears to have increased relative to the social assistance payments made to non-participants. This suggests that, in the short run, the SSP appears to have achieved its dual objectives of improving financial self-sufficiency while reducing poverty levels of participants. Given that these findings stem from early evaluations, it is difficult to accurately predict the impacts of earnings supplements. Only after more comprehensive follow-up studies have been conducted can these impacts be assessed.

There is also not enough evidence to determine whether or not the initial increases in combined social assistance and earnings supplement payment will persist, although these initial incremental costs are expected because of the program design.

In Canada, some concern was reported regarding earnings supplement clients who would have found work regardless of the program (estimated to be about 40% of participants who found employment). Given that, overall, the study found that participants who find work, do so at wage rates which are at or close to minimum wage levels, however, it may be beneficial to continue to provide earnings supplements to these individuals.

3.9 Results of Job Placement Services

Alberta's Job Placement Services Program contracts the services of placement agencies to provide job placement opportunities to employable social assistance recipients. The evaluation (1995) conducted detailed outcome assessments of thirteen of the sixteen job placement contracts under the program. The study found that according to the information obtained from pla-

cement agencies upon a request from the evaluators, 43% of social assistance recipients accepted into the program had been placed into employment up to 18 months following participation. However, based on the information generated from Alberta's client monitoring system and from the survey of clients, this proportion is likely closer to 29 %.

Among those individuals who were placed, agency records suggest that 80% were still working one month after the placement, and 61% were still employed three months following the placement. Moreover, these records suggest a high success rate in terms of clients remaining with the same employer, ranging from 75% to 100% depending on the agency.

The study indicates, however, that agencies have not been successful in moving clients to better, higher skilled, and potentially higher paying positions. Of the 28 types of jobs in which clients possessed prior experience, only nine categories saw increases in the number of participants placed. In fact, the evaluation found significant decreases in the number of clients placed in management, supervisory, and skilled positions. For instance, the study found an 81% decrease in the number of participants in senior, middle and other management positions, over a 90% decrease in skilled primary and manufacturing industry positions, and a 78% decrease in skilled administrative and business positions.

The study also reported that many of the worker clients indicated that their expectations were not met. Among these individuals, 18% felt that the agency was incompetent and unprofessional. Moreover, of the 33% of clients who reported dissatisfaction with the agency's assessment of client's strengths and weaknesses, 22% stated that their dissatisfaction was due to unprofessionalism and general disinterest on the part of the delivery agent.

The Athabasca Regional Career Services (ARCS) Model in Alberta provides single-window job placement services to social assistance recipients by combining federal, provincial and private sector services under one roof. The evaluation of the model (1994) found that during the two year study period the volume and caseload of social assistance recipients in the Athabasca region declined following the establishment of ARCS at a faster pace than other regions of Alberta. Only 40% of this decline, however, could be attributed to clients finding and maintaining employment.

The results of the evaluation did not indicate that the ARCS model produced employment outcomes up to one year following program completion which were greater than those observed in the Grande Prairie comparison region. However, the study showed that ARCS clients found employment about nine weeks faster than their counterparts in Grande Prairie. The study also reported that while jobs were obtained more quickly in Athabasca, these jobs tended to be slightly lower paying and of less duration than those found in the comparison region.

An examination of the costs associated with the ARCS model compared to traditional service delivery in Grande Prairie suggests that, overall, the difference in cost per unit of service is $13 lower in Athabasca. This represents a savings of almost $130,000 during the measurement period (October 1991 to October 1993), or about one-third of the total budget allocated to ARCS's employment preparation and job placement services.

According to a 1994 study, 49 of the 81 clients referred to the Workplace Support Pilot Project in Alberta were placed in work environments. Among these, 30 clients worked for a minimum of 12 weeks in their placement. Almost 86% of the clients placed in employment (42 clients) earned hourly

wages from these placements which were less than $9.00, with one-third (14) earning less than $6.00 per hour. Overall, 20 clients (16%) were provided with on-the-job training, with only 30% (6) of these maintaining their position at the completion of the program.

3.9.1 Lessons Learned

Given the limited sample and scope of the studies investigating the impacts of job placement services for social assistance recipients, it is difficult to draw sound conclusions relating to their effectiveness. Nevertheless, based on the findings from the three Alberta studies, it appears that, while private sector delivery can achieve positive results in improving the employability of social assistance recipients in a cost-effective manner, continued close federal and provincial government presence may be necessary to ensure that services are rendered which demonstrate integrity and responsiveness to client needs.

The three job placement services were found to place participants in relatively low paying jobs. This finding is consistent with those of job search assistance and wage subsidy programs. In the absence of additional and/or longer term findings with respect to lower post-program earnings among individuals who find work, it is difficult to accurately identify the reasons for this occurrence.

3.10 Results of Mixed Strategies

The evaluation of Alberta's Career Training Program (1991) found that the program achieved an overall 73% placement rate among participants (based on only 53 cases). Employment status was found to be directly related to the amount of time elapsed since program completion. That is, the longer the period of time since the completion of the program, the more likely the participants were to be employed (the duration of the post-program or client follow-up period was not provided in the document reviewed). The study also reported that individuals who completed the program and found employment earned wages between $5.00 and $6.00 per hour.

In addition, the study indicated that participants reported only modest satisfaction with the career guidance and financial management components of the life skills training. Moreover, the evaluation revealed that matching participants in jobs which were relevant and appropriate to their career aspirations, backgrounds and needs was only marginally obtained.

The evaluation of the Actions positives pour le travail et l'emploi (APTE) program did not report any significant impacts resulting from participation, with the exception of the education/ training component of the program. The study found that services provided to clients which were aimed at increasing their level of education, contributed significantly to reducing the amount of time these clients were in receipt of social assistance up to 12 months following program completion. It was also reported that this component of the program helped to ease clients' transition into the labour market.

The Process Evaluation of NB Works (1995) reported that the selection and recruitment process was found to have met the program goals of securing participants who were members of the project target group (single or two-parent units where adults have a minimum of a grade 7 education, but not a grade 12 education), and who are regionally representative of social assistance recipients across the province. The evaluation suggested, however, that detailed assessments of clients may be necessary in order to develop programming

which best suits the needs of participants.

A survey of NB Works participants revealed that, although 53% of respondents who had been enrolled in academic upgrading through the project stated that this component was what they had expected, 37% reported that it was more difficult than they had anticipated. Moreover, 65% of those who exited the program prior to completing all stages indicated that the academic upgrading component was very or somewhat difficult. The study also found that the majority of those who exited the project early, did so during academic upgrading.

Moreover, while 68% of respondents reported that, overall, they were satisfied with the academic upgrading which they received through NB Works, fewer than 1% indicated that they were not at all satisfied. The vast majority of respondents (95%) also stated that the academic upgrading component was very or somewhat important in their ability to find future employment.

One of the more primary concerns raised in the evaluation was the slower than anticipated movement of clients through the academic upgrading component of NB Works. Many clients were found to not have completed this component in sufficient time to take full advantage of the other stages of the project. Consequently, the study identified a need to develop alternate programming which more effectively meets the particular requirements of clients such that they can achieve the academic upgrading goals within established timetables.

As was the case with academic upgrading, participants reported a high degree of satisfaction with the skills training stage of NB Works. Although based on a sample of only 76 individuals, overall, 98% of survey respondents indicated that they were very or somewhat satisfied with the program, 97% stated that they were being challenged, 91% believed that the skills training was interesting, and 92% felt that the training would make a significant contribution to their future employment.

The evaluation also estimated that the training provided to participants has been in areas of projected occupational growth areas for New Brunswick. The study cautions, however, that projected growth areas may not reflect actual future growth patterns.

Internships are designed to provide clients with the opportunity to acquire career-oriented on-the-job training. The evaluation reported, however, that while 50% of internship participants who were surveyed indicated that their internship position was directly related to their career goal, 24% reported that the position was indirectly related, and 26% stated that the position was not at all related. The internship positions for the majority of respondents in the latter group were in clerical, receptionist, cashier, and labouring jobs.

About 60% of employers of internship participants reported that, compared to other supervised employees, NB Works clients were similar in terms of their attendance, and ability and intent to learn. However, 61% of employers also stated that NB Works interns possessed fewer well-developed skills than other staff members in similar positions.

The process evaluation of the Nova Scotia Compass Program (1995) indicates that after six months, the program appears to be reaching a considerable portion of its target population. Moreover, the various components of the program were found to be successfully meeting the needs of their clients. For instance, the Work Experience Option of the program has met with success in terms of identifying and referring youth into job placements. To date, over 1,400 clients have been referred to employment, resulting in 255

job placements. In addition, preliminary study results indicate that 34% of clients who have completed the placement term have obtained a job with their host employer.

This evaluation also found that there has been a higher than anticipated enrollment of job-ready clients in the Transitional Training Option of Compass (expectations were not provided in the report). Overall, according to survey findings, 67% of these individuals who have completed the training have obtained employment.

Fewer than expected single parents on family benefits have taken-up the Transitional Training Option (expectations were not provided in the report). This was found to be primarily due to weak linkages between the various partners. Moreover, as a result of the lack of transportation, limited childcare services and the fear of losing pharmaceutical and medical benefits, the employment needs of single parents have not been met as successfully as the job-ready clients.

This study also found that the training component of the Enterprise Development Option is successfully providing clients with the knowledge and skill base necessary to establish and operate small businesses. The business loans offered through this option, however, have not yet leveraged additional resources for business start-up costs.

The evaluation reported that much of the success of the Compass program is a result of the supportive and complementary nature of the program with the activities of the Employment Resource Centres and provincial counselling staff. In addition, the unexpected high levels of employment found among program completers was attributed to the appropriateness of referrals made to the Compass programs.

The introduction of the Job Developer function to the Nova Scotia Compass Program, dedicated to matching job-ready clients to local employers, has also had a positive impact on securing placements of clients into employment, and has allowed counsellors, previously responsible for placement activities, to provide more effective counselling services to clients more in need.

The Compass program has met with a high degree of satisfaction among both employers and clients placed. Worker clients reported that the opportunity provided to them to obtain relevant work experience, and the role played by the Job Developer in helping them find a placement were of considerable importance to them. Nevertheless, some clients in the Work Experience Option expressed concern that the level of pay associated with their participation was too low.

About three-quarters of the employers surveyed rated the services received from the Compass Job Developers as better or much better than those received from other training programs. Some of the more prominent reasons for their high levels of satisfaction included the duration of the placement (a full six months rather than a few weeks), the wide skill base among clients from which to choose; the limited paperwork; and the time saved in the client screening process.

The review of the FUTURES program in Ontario (1987) identified a number of criticisms relating to this initiative. One of these is its apparent lack of focus and sensitivity to the training needs of social assistance recipients, resulting in the provision of inappropriate programming measures. FUTURES appears to be most effective for high functioning job-ready youth experiencing difficulty obtaining their first job, and not for youth who are more employment disadvantaged.

Moreover, the program has been accused of "creaming" in order to serve clients least in need, but easier to serve. There is some evidence,

however, to suggest that FUTURES has helped many youth overcome employment barriers which previously prevented them from engaging in labour market activities.

Another reported criticism of the FUTURES program is its limited use of targeting. Lack of targeting has resulted in the design of strategies which do not meet the needs of specific groups. Rather, the program aims to fit all individuals into standardized programs, regardless of their level of employability.

For instance, the upper limit of 16 weeks in work placements was found to be insufficient for severely employment disadvantaged individuals to learn specific job skills and general work habits. In addition, specific needs of single mothers, such as childcare and life skills training are not met through the program. As a result, many of these clients cannot participate in program components requiring their full time attendance.

The 1987 review of Ontario's Employment Opportunities Program (EOP) reported that the program appears to serve many clients who would have found employment in the absence of the program. However, EOP has made significant progress in increasing the number of clients served who are extremely employment disadvantaged. In addition, the review found that EOP appears to address specific client needs in terms of skills training and social support. Many other programs have not focussed on client needs, which has resulted in considerable barriers to successful program participation.

Another strength of the program was found to be the involvement of local level organizations in the design and delivery of EOP and its components.

The Employment Support Initiative (ESI) component of the program was not found to be as effective as other components. The ESI provides financial incentives and subsidized childcare and transportation to female social assistance recipients wishing to enter or re-enter the labour market. The program focusses on providing life skills assistance, as well as specific job skills training.

Overall, however, data suggest that only 10% of participants found full time employment in the first year following program completion, with another 9% obtaining part-time employment. Furthermore, the majority of women who found work did so in traditional low paying female jobs.

The evaluation of Newfoundland's Skills Assessment and Training Centre (1990) indicated that 26% of the clients obtained employment immediately following their participation. Of these, one-half were placed directly into a job by the Centre, while the remaining 50% found employment independently. The study also found that 47% of the clients surveyed for the evaluation indicated that they agreed that the program helped them find work. Moreover, 27% of the respondents reported that they were employed at the time of the survey (anywhere between 3 to 30 months following program participation).

According to the information presented in the evaluation of the Skills Assessment and Training Centre, it appears to have had a positive impact on preparing clients for employment. Overall, 60% of the clients surveyed indicated that the Centre had helped them get training for a job, 59% reported that the Centre had helped them improve their job finding skills, and 67% stated that it had helped them identify their skills and abilities. In addition, clients indicated an overwhelmingly positive perception of the treatment they received from program staff during their participation. Over 90% of the clients surveyed reported that they felt that the Centre staff showed an interest in them, were helpful, were available, and treated them with respect.

The early findings from three tests sites of the JOBS program (1995) in the U.S. (Atlanta, Georgia; Grand Rapids, Michigan; and Riverside, California) found that two years into the program, the job re-entry component (i.e., job search assistance, work experience, and short term training) participants were 8% more likely to have found employment than members of the comparison group. Moreover, about one-half of this impact came from participants obtaining jobs that paid $10,000 per year or more. As a result, average monthly earnings of participants were 26% higher than earnings of control group members ($285 per month compared to $226 per month, respectively). These earnings impacts were particularly large for those with higher educations (high school diploma or more) and for mothers of preschool-aged children.

JOBS was also found to have a significant impact in reducing receipt and payments of welfare among participants. Overall, more than 11% fewer participants than control group members were receiving social assistance after two years of program participation. In addition, the program resulted in an 8% reduction in the number of participants requiring food stamps, relative to the comparison group. The evaluation also estimated that the program led to a $61 decrease in average monthly welfare payments made to participants.

The Human Capital Development (HCD) component of the JOBS program postpones job entry so that clients can engage in longer-term skills and academic upgrading activities. Results of the evaluation of this component suggest that after two years, the program did not produce significant impacts on employment and earnings of participants.

The study did reveal, however, that HCD had a significant impact on reducing the receipt and payments of welfare among participants. Overall, about 4% fewer participants than control group members were receiving social assistance two years into the program, while program group members received average monthly welfare payments which were almost $40 less than non-participants.

The absence of earnings gains among HCD clients, combined with the reduction in welfare payments, resulted in a 6% reduction in total income from all sources for participants.

The three year impact study of California's GAIN program (1994) suggests that in the third year of participation, average incomes of single parent participants (who made up 82% of the sample) were $636 higher than for non-participants. This represents a 25% increase over the comparison group. By the end of the third year, average earnings for participants were over $1,400 higher than comparison group members, or about a 22% increase over the comparison group (the actual pre- and post-earnings were not provided in the report reviewed).

The program also appears to have led to reductions in welfare payments to single parent participants. Overall, in the third year, participants received an average of $331 less in welfare payments relative to the control group (representing an 8% reduction), and a $961 decrease in the entire three year period, or a 6% reduction (the actual pre- and post-welfare payments were not provided in the report reviewed).

GAIN was also found to have a positive impact in improving the rates of employment among participants, as well as in modestly reducing the number of individuals on welfare. Specifically, 57% of the participants were found to have been employed at some time during the three year follow-up period of the study, compared to 51% of non-participants. In addition, in the first year of participation, 73% of clients had received welfare payments, compared to 76% of non-participants, while

in the third year of the program, 53% of GAIN clients were on welfare, versus 56% of non-participants (the actual pre- and post-employment and welfare receipt rates were not provided in the report reviewed).

Two separate sources of information were found with respect to the Massachusetts ET Program. The first was a 1990 study which examined changes in welfare caseloads in Massachusetts and other northeastern states. This study utilized a database of welfare caseloads from 1970 to 1988 to track and identify trends in welfare receipt over time. The second study, published in 1991, compiled a longitudinal database of welfare recipients in Massachusetts. This database contained information on individuals who had participated in the ET Program between January 1986 and June 1987, as well as on non-participants comparison group members. A survey of 1,777 ET participants who obtained employment following their participation was also conducted to supplement the longitudinal information.

The 1990 evaluation found that, between 1970 and 1987, little, if any of the measured decline in welfare caseloads in Massachusetts could be attributed to the program. The study reported that these decreases were likely due to improvements in the economy and to modifications to the levels of social assistance benefits available to welfare recipients. Specifically, between 1982 and 1988, the Massachusetts caseload of welfare recipients declined by 3%. During this period of economic boom, however, the welfare caseload in New York and Rhode Island also declined by 3%, while Connecticut's caseload fell by 12.5% and New Jersey's by 17%. The study suggested that the program's failure to significantly reduce the number of welfare recipients during this time could be the result of a growing number of severely disadvantaged individuals on welfare in Massachusetts.

The evaluation also reported that between 1985 and 1987, women single heads of households participating in the ET Program were 10% more likely to receive social assistance than women single heads of households receiving welfare benefits in other states.

The study's financial analysis of the program estimated that from 1984 to 1988, the program operated at a net loss of $210 Million. In fact, according to the evaluation report, the only financial gain associated with the program was the $13 Million incremental increase in tax revenue generated from ET graduates who found work following their participation.

The 1991 evaluation of the ET Program revealed that between January 1986 and June 1987, ET reduced the amount of time spent on welfare by participants. The average duration of welfare receipt among ET clients was 10 months, compared to 14 months among members of the comparison group. The study also estimated that on average, participation in the ET Program reduced welfare payments made to clients by about $25 per month, or 8% over what they would have received in the absence of the program. This reduction was highest for individuals in the supported work component of the program (a reduction of $101 per month), and lowest among those in education and training components (a $27 per month increase for those in remedial education, and a $38 per month increase for those in advanced academic upgrading).

Overall, the 1991 evaluation found that roughly 45% of the participants were employed six months following their participation in the ET Program, compared to only 36% of members of the comparison group. Increased employment rates were found to be highest among clients in the job placement and the supported work experience (about 15 percentage points more than the comparison group in each case). In addition, the study reported that participation in the

ET program led to an increase in earnings in the six months following participation by $390, or 34%. Again, this was found to be highest among clients in the supported work component ($885 increase) and the job placement component ($518 increase). The study did not find any statistically significant impacts of the ET Program on increasing or decreasing returns to welfare after program completion.

3.10.1 Lessons Learned

The studies of mixed strategies programs reveal that initiatives which focus on client needs tend to be more successful in integrating social assistance recipients into the workforce than those which provide standardized programming. Mixed strategy programs focussing on client needs were found to lead to higher than anticipated rates of post-program employment, while those with less focus on client needs had no significant impacts on improving the employability of clients. Moreover, focussed mixed strategy programs in the U.S. helped to increase the incomes of clients who found employment, and reduced welfare dependency and payments among participants.

The findings from these studies suggest that appropriate screening is also necessary to ensure that relevant services are provided to each client. Early findings from the Nova Scotia Compass and NB Works programs indicate that this can be accomplished through effective partnerships and communication between various levels of service providers, as well as between service providers and clients.

4.0 SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS

Overall, the studies conducted on Canadian and U.S. programs designed to integrate social assistance recipients into the workforce revealed that these programs have met with mixed results in terms of achieving their objectives. A summary of the results of the programs reviewed in this document is presented in Table 2. This table provides the highlights from the evaluations on programs for enhancing the employability of social assistance recipients by type of program along three main impact points (i.e., employability, earnings, and social assistance dependency and payments).

4.1 Overall Impacts on Employability

As can be seen in the table, each type of program was found to have met with some degree of success in terms of improving the employability of social assistance recipients, however, this success appears to be dependent on the type of client served, and/or the delivery mechanism associated with the program.

For instance, while life skills training and work experience programs were generally found to have considerable positive impacts on enhancing employment among more disadvantaged clients who face systematic barriers to labour market integration, job placement services tend to be more effective for job-ready participants.

In addition, studies suggest that clients of on-the-job training programs delivered through private contracted agencies fare better than those of programs delivered through the public sector. Studies also found that classroom training which is more vocationally-oriented is more likely to improve the employability of social assistance recipients than is academic upgrading.

Similarly, mixed strategy programs appear to yield the best results with respect to helping clients find work when these programs focus on the individual needs of clients.

It is interesting to note that the two types of programs which have met with the least success in improving employability (i.e., pre-employment training and job search assistance) are both aimed at improving generic job skills and job search skills.

4.2 Overall Impacts on Earnings

In general, based on the studies reviewed, programs in Canada designed to enhance the employability of social assistance recipients do not appear to have been as effective as U.S. programs in terms of improving the earnings of participants. Overall, on-the-job and life skills training, job search assistance, work experience programs, wage subsidies, and mixed strategy programs delivered in the U.S. were found to have had significant impacts on increasing the earnings of participants.

In Canada, however, little or no earnings impacts were found. In fact, studies have concluded that clients of on-the-job training and wage subsidy programs who found employment, did so in lower paying jobs. Moreover, while the SSP evaluation reported improved earnings as a result of program participation, these earnings represented a combination of social assistance payments and income from employment.

TABLE 2
HIGHLIGHTS OF RESULTS OF STUDIES REVIEWED

	IMPACT POINTS		
Program	**Employability**	**Earnings**	**Social Assistance Dependency and Payments**
On-The-Job Training	Mixed results with respect to employability, although on-the-job training programs delivered through private or not-for-profit agencies were consistently found to have positive impacts on the employment of clients and helped trainees find and/or retain employment in positions for which they were trained.	In Canada, on-the-job training was not found to have significant effects on increasing post-program wages of participants, which may be due to trainees finding lower paying jobs. In the US, programs led to considerable earnings gains, which were attributable to participants finding higher paying jobs.	On-the-job training in British Columbia was found to lead to immediate decreases in social assistance dependency, but trainees returned to social assistance (or began to rely on other types of income assistance such as UI) two to three years following participation. In Alberta and Quebec, the proportion of program clients in receipt of social assistance was found to decrease following the training.
Classroom Training	No consistent program impacts on employability. Some evidence that classroom training which is more vocational in nature achieves the best results in terms of integrating social assistance recipients into the work force.	No consistent program impacts on earnings.	In Canada, technical and vocational training were found to have a significant impact on reducing the number of months trainees drawing social assistance, thus reducing overall social assistance payments made to these individual. Academic and basic education training had limited implications for reducing social assistance dependency. In the US, no consistent impacts on reductions in welfare dependency among participants were found.

	IMPACT POINTS		
Program	**Employability**	**Earnings**	**Social Assistance Dependency and Payments**
Pre-Employment Training	Moderately effective in integrating social assistance recipients into the workforce. Overall, while a higher proportion of participants of pre-employment training programs were found to obtain full time employment than were non-participants, fewer than one-third of the participants actually found jobs following the training.	Impacts on earnings not reported	Pre-employment training programs have met with only marginal success with respect to reducing social assistance payments made to participants. Also, because these programs often provide additional benefits to participants such as daycare and transportation subsidies, the fact that more participants tend to work part time and thus retain their eligibility for social assistance, and due to many clients shifting the burden of income support from UI to social assistance, they were found not to be cost-effective means of integrating social assistance recipients into the labour market from a provincial government budget perspective.
Life Skills Training	Life Skills Training programs have had considerable impacts in improving the employability and educational attainment of women and youth.	No earnings impacts were reported for programs in Canada. Little or no impacts on earnings were found as a result of participation in U.S. programs.	In Canada, studies identified considerable impacts of life-skills programs on reducing receipt and payments of social assistance. In the US, moderate decreases in social assistance receipt were found.
Job Search Assistance	No evidence of increased employability was found in studies assessing Canadian Job Search Assistance programs. In the US, the majority of the Job Search Assistance programs studied were found to have modest but positive impacts on increasing the employability of participants.	No evidence of increased earnings was found in studies assessing Job Search Assistance programs in Canada. In the US, almost all Job Search Assistance programs studied were found to have positive impacts on increasing the earnings of participants (from a low of $69 per year on average to a high of $658 per year on average among programs which yielded positive results).	In Canada, in the short run, Job Search Assistance (typically limited to job clubs) helped reduce the number of participants in receipt of social assistance, but in the long run, these individuals tended to gravitate back to income support. In the US, studies found that with most job search assistance programs, welfare receipt and payments to participants were reduced.

	IMPACT POINTS		
Program	**Employability**	**Earnings**	**Social Assistance Dependency and Payments**
Work Experience Programs (provision of tangible work experience and exposure to the workplace to clients)	The work experience programs reviewed which focus on severely disadvantaged welfare recipients were found to result in immediate increases in the numbers of participants employed, as well as in the job retention of participants. Broad-based coverage programs were found to have no impacts on employability.	A U.S. program targeted towards severely disadvantaged social assistance recipients has led to considerable earnings increases for up to three years No evidence of earnings impacts was found in programs in Canada.	Among the programs reviewed, those targeted at highly barriered social assistance recipients were found to reduce their reliance on social assistance, while clients of broad-based coverage programs were not found to have any significant decreases in welfare dependency.
Wage Subsidies (provision of subsidies to employers who hire worker clients)	Wage Subsidy programs have had a positive impact for social assistance recipients on increasing overall employment (British Columbia), permanent employment among participants who found work (Quebec), and the proportion of time working (Alberta).	In Canada, there is some evidence suggesting that participants were more likely to find lower paying jobs than were non-participants. In the U.S. program reviewed, earnings were found to increase by an average of $10 per week during the school year, and $13 per week during the summer over those of the comparison group for 73% of the sample.	Some impacts were found on reducing short term social assistance receipt or payment.
Earnings Supplements (provision of income support to clients over and above any income earned from employment)	Significant impacts in increasing short term employability of participants.	In Canada, program participants were found to receive higher monthly incomes from all sources than were comparison group members (up to $235).	Canada's Earnings Supplement program has led to a decrease in the number of SARS, but an increase in the total income support payments (social assistance and/or earnings supplements). Minnesota's Earnings Supplement program has led to an increase in the number of participants combining work and welfare, but in the short run, participants are less likely than non-participants to completely move off welfare.
Job Placement Services	In Canada, Job Placement Services appear to have helped increase employment, job retention and/or the pace at which job-ready SARS found employment.	No measurement of the impacts of Job Placement Services on earnings.	One of the three Job Placement Services reviewed has resulted in a reduction in the volume and caseload of SARS.

	IMPACT POINTS		
Program	**Employability**	**Earnings**	**Social Assistance Dependency and Payments**
Mixed Strategies	Mixed Strategies programs which focus on client needs have led to higher than anticipated employment among participants, while those with less focus on client needs do not have significant impacts on improving employability of clients.	In the US, Mixed Strategies programs focussing on client needs have had considerable impacts on increasing the incomes of clients who find employment Data not available for programs in Canada.	In the US, Mixed Strategies focussing on client needs have had considerable impacts on reducing welfare dependency and payments among clients Data not available for programs in Canada.

It should be noted, however, that many studies in Canada did not attempt to measure the impacts of programs designed to integrate social assistance recipients into the workforce on earnings.

4.3 Overall Impacts on Social Assistance Dependency and Payments

The findings from the studies reviewed for this document suggest that programs designed to integrate social assistance recipients into the workforce have been moderately successful in reducing social assistance dependency and payments made to clients.

Among all types of programs identified in this report, it appears that life skills training in Canada has had the largest impact in reducing reliance on social assistance for its clients.

Vocational and technical classroom instruction were also found to be effective vehicles for reducing social assistance receipt and payments, however, basic academic upgrading had only limited effects.

Similarly, earnings supplements and pre-employment training were found to have significant impacts on reducing social assistance dependency, but because of the costs associated with the additional subsidies made to clients in these programs, in the short run, they have not been cost-effective.

In addition, mixed strategy programs appear to have been successful in reducing welfare receipt and payments made to clients in the U.S., but primarily when these programs have focussed on the individual needs of the participants. Also, while on-the-job training and job search assistance in Canada have been found to reduce social assistance caseloads among participants, there is indication that these clients are merely shifting their reliance on social assistance to other forms of income support.

4.4 Overall Conclusion

The review of the literature pertaining to programs designed to integrate social assistance recipients into the workforce indicates that the achievement of objectives and intended impacts is a challenging process. While some programs have successfully improved the employability of social assistance recipients, others have met with little or no success. Moreover, a few of the programs studied which were found to have positive effects in improving employment and earnings, and in reducing social assistance dependency, were also found to be considerably costly to administer.

Unfortunately, the literature review did not reveal many consistent impacts across type of program. Furthermore, as can be seen in Table 3 which summarizes what has worked well for various sub-groups of participants, very limited differences were identified with respect to the impacts of these programs on different types of clients. As a result, there does not appear to be a "magical solution" to integrating social assistance recipients into the workforce.

Consequently, governments should be prepared to continue, if not put more effort into, monitoring and tracking the short and long term outcomes of programs; sharing information with other program representatives and/or governments; and adapting programming as required to best suit the needs of the clients, while keeping costs to a minimum.

TABLE 3
WHAT HAS WORKED WELL FOR WHOM
SUMMARY OF EVALUATION FINDINGS AMONG SUB-GROUPS WHERE RESULTS DIFFER FROM THOSE OF THE GENERAL POPULATION OF PARTICIPANTS[2]

PROGRAM	HAS WORKED WELL	HAS NOT WORKED WELL
On-The-Job Training	**Women and francophone SARS in Quebec** benefit in terms of improved employability and reduced social assistance dependency.	
Classroom Training	Reductions in social assistance dependency among participants with **higher education levels**. **In Quebec, clients with a grade 9 to 11 education, and those born outside of Canada** experienced employment gains and reductions in social assistance.	Increases in social assistance payments to **single parent women**.
Life Skills Training	Positive impacts for **women in Canada** in terms of employability, earnings and social assistance dependency. **Females with children in the US** were more likely to complete secondary school as a result of the program.	**Female participants with children in the US** experienced lower post-program earnings and employment than adults without children.
Work Experience Programs	In the long run, **highly-barriered participants in Canada** experience gains in employment and job retention, while reducing their reliance on social assistance. Considerable earnings increases, employment gains, and reductions in social assistance receipt and payments for **severely disadvantaged welfare recipients in the US**.	
Wage Subsidies	Pronounced earnings and employability impacts on **older workers and longer term SARS.** Wage subsidies helped improve employment and earnings of **Black Youth in the US**.	Lower probability of employment and earnings gains for **single parents**.
Earnings Supplements		Increased welfare payments made to **two-parent families** in the Minnesota experiment.
Mixed Strategies	In general, Standardized Mixed Strategy programs were found to be most effective for **job-ready youth in Canada**. Larger employment and earnings impacts for **clients with higher education levels and mothers of preschool-aged children in the US**. Increased earnings and reduced welfare payments for **single parents in the US**.	Standardized Mixed Strategy programs are not typically geared towards meeting the special needs of **severely employment disadvantaged clients**. These standardized program designs tend to have limited or negative impacts on the employment of such individuals.

[2] Only the differences reported in study findings are presented in this table. Where differences among sub-groups are not presented, the results correspond to those of the general program participant population.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Alberta Career Development and Employment. *Futures Program Evaluation: Executive Summary*, Policy and Research Division, August 1992.

Alberta Management Group. *An Evaluation of the Athabasca Regional Career Services Model: Technical Report*, March 1994.

Alberta Management Group and Gail V. Barrington & Associates. *The Integrated Training Pilot Project: A Process Evaluation - Technical Report*, Alberta Advanced Education and Career Development, May 1995.

Allie, Emile. *La dépendance à la sécurité du revenue: une analyse du programme APPORT*, Gouvernement du Québec, Ministère de la Main-d'oeuvre, de la Sécurité du revenu et de la Formation professionnelle, Mars 1992.

Andy Rowe Consulting Economists. *Evaluation Framework for the Employability Enhancement Program: Draft Final Report*, Newfoundland Department of Social Services, March 1992.

Applications Management Consulting Ltd. *Benefit-Cost Analysis of Four Pre-Employment Training Programs: Final Report*, Alberta Advanced Education and Career Development, June 1993.

Applications Management Consulting Ltd. *Job Placement Services For SFI Clients: Final Summary Report*, Alberta Advanced Education and Career Development, May 1994.

Applications Management Consulting Ltd. *Outcome Evaluation of the Job Placement Services Program: Final Report*, Alberta Advanced Education and Career Development, June 1995.

Applications Management Consulting Ltd. *Review of the Skills Development Program: Phase I Final Report*, Alberta Advanced Education and Career Development, May 1995.

Applications Management Consulting Ltd. *Skills Development Program Evaluation Framework: Phase II Final Report*, Alberta Advanced Education and Career Development, May 1995.

Atkinson, A.B., and Mogensen, Gunnar V., eds. *Welfare and Work Incentives: A Northern European Perspective*, Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1993.

Ball, Caroline, and Houser, Angela. *An Examination of the Impact of Employment Training Programs on Social Assistance Recipients in Hamilton-Wentworth*, Hamilton: Social Planning and Research Council of Hamilton and District, June 1989.

Bancroft, Wendy and Currie Vernon, Sheila. *The Struggle for Self-Sufficiency: Participants in the Self-Sufficiency Project Talk About Work, Welfare, and Their Futures*, Vancouver: Social Research and Demonstration Corporation, December 1995.

Bardach, Eugene. *Improving the Productivity of JOBS Programs*, Papers for Practitioners, New York: Manpower Demonstration Research Corporation, December 1993.

Baseline Market Research Ltd. *New Brunswick Jobs Corps Process Evaluation: Final Report*, New Brunswick Job Corps Evaluation Committee, December, 1995.

Baseline Market Research Ltd., and Norpark. *NB Works Process Evaluation: Year-End Report*, NB Works Evaluation Committee, June 1995.

Bell, Stephen H, and Orr, Larry L. "Is Subsidized Employment Cost Effective for Welfare Recipients?" *Journal of Human Resources*, 1994, XXIX (1): 42-61.

Brock, Thomas, Butler, David, Long, David. *Unpaid Work Experience For Welfare Recipients: Findings and Lessons from MDRC Research*, New York: Manpower Demonstration Research Corporation, September, 1993.

Buckle, Leslie. *Evaluation of Three Life Skills Programs in Calgary: Final Report*, Alberta Advanced Education and Career Development, May 1994.

Burt Perrin Associates. *A Review of Training and Educational Programs for Social Assistance Recipients Entering the Labour Force: Final Report*, Toronto: Social Assistance Review Committee, March 1987.

Card, David and Robins, Philip K. *Do Financial Incentives Encourage Welfare Recipients to Work?: Initial 18-Month Findings from the Self-Sufficiency Project*, Vancouver: Social Research and Demonstration Corporation, February 1996.

Cassidy, Frank, and Seward, Shirley B., eds. *Alternatives to Social Assistance in Indian Communities*, Halifax: Institute for Research on Public Policy, 1991.

Couch, Kenneth A. "New Evidence on the Long-Term Effects of Employment Training Programs," *Journal of Labor Economics* X (4), 1992, 380-387.

Cramm, Frank and Kelleher, Royston. *Attempting to Break the Cycle: An Evaluation of the Skills Assessment and Training Centre*, St. John's: March 1990.

Criterion Research Corp. *Summary Report of the Survey of Clients on the CDMS Database*, Alberta Advanced Education and Career Development, June 1995.

Day, Ron. "Evaluation of the Program in Newfoundland to Enhance the Employability of Social Assistance Recipients." Paper presented to the National Evaluation Meeting, Ottawa, Canada, February 13-14, 1990.

Deslauriers, Jacques; Gagné, Pierre; Beaulieu, Claudine; Hardy, Michèle; and Lanctôt. *De l'aide sociale à la sécurité du revenu: Rapport statistique 1991-1992*, Gouvernement du Québec, Ministère de la Main-d'oeuvre de la Sécurité du revenu et de la Formation professionnelle, Avril 1993.

Dickinson, P.T. *Evaluation of the Canada Assistance Plan (CAP)*, Ottawa: Health and Welfare Canada, January 1991.

Duffett, Melvin. *The Psycho-Social Effects of Unemployment, Including a Literature Search on Theories, Descriptions of various Approaches to Deal With the Problem as Well as Perceived Goals and Objectives of the Newfoundland Approach*, Background paper for the departmental review of the Employment Opportunities Program, Newfoundland Department of Social Services, January 1990.

Ernst & Young. *Crossover Program Evaluation*, Alberta Advanced Education and Career Development, May 1993.

Ernst & Young. *Evaluation of Programs for Social Allowance Recipients: Final Report*, Alberta Career Development and Employment, April 1991.

Fortin, Bernard, Lacroix, Guy, and Roberge, Hélène. *Une analyse des mouvements de clientèles à l'aide de dernier recours: premier rapport d'étape*, Centre de recherche en économie et finance appliquées, Québec: Université Laval, Septembre 1994.

Freedman, Stephen and Friedlander, Daniel. *The JOBS Evaluation: Early Findings on Program Impacts in Three Sites: Executive Summary*, U.S. Department of Health and Human Services and U.S. Department of Education, New York: Manpower Demonstration Research Corporation, September 1995.

Friedlander, Daniel, and Burtless, Gary. *Five Years After: The Long-Term Effects of Welfare-to-Work Programs*, Manpower Demonstration Research Corporation, New York, N.Y.: Russell Sage Foundation, 1994.

Friedlander, Daniel, and Hamilton, Gayle. *The Saturation Work Initiative Model in San Diego: A Five Year Follow-up Study*, New York: Manpower Demonstration Research Corporation, July 1993.

Gabor, Peter. *Target Program Evaluation*, Alberta Advanced Education and Career Development, June 1993.

Gagné, Pierre; Audet, Luc; Beaulieu, Claudine; Boisvert, Alain; and Poirier, Yannick. *De l'aide sociale à la sécurité du revenu: Rapport statistique 1992-1993*, Gouvernement du Québec, Ministère de la Main-d'oeuvre de la Sécurité du revenu et de la Formation professionnelle, Janvier 1994.

Gail V. Barrington & Associates. *Evaluation of the Career Training Program of Columbia Institute of Canada*, Alberta Career Development and Employment, March 1991.

Gail V. Barrington & Associates. *Evaluation of the Office Skills Development Program of McManus & Associates*, Alberta Career Development and Employment, February 1991.

Garfinkel, Irwin. "The Child-Support Revolution," *The Economic Support of Child-Raining*, AEA Papers and Proceedings, May 1994, 81-85.

Gladstone, David. *British Social Welfare: Past, Present and Future*, London: UCL Press, 1995.

Gorlick, Carolyne A. *Taking Chances: Single Mothers and Their Children Exiting Welfare*, London: University of Western Ontario.

Gouvernement du Québec, Ministère de la Main-d'oeuvre de la Sécurité du revenu et de la Formation professionnelle, *Évaluation des expériences acquises par les prestataires participant aux programmes PAIE, PSMT, et EXTRA: le point de vue des employeurs*, Avril 1992.

Gueron, Judith M. *Lessons From a Job Guarantee: The Youth Incentive Entitlement Pilot Projects*, New York: Manpower Demonstration Research Corporation, June 1984.

Gueron, Judith M. *Reforming Welfare with Work*, Occasional Paper, no. 2, New York, N.Y.: Ford Foundation, 1987.

Gueron, Judith M. *Work Initiatives for Welfare Recipients*, New York: Manpower Demonstration Research Corporation, March 1986.

Gueron, Judith M. *Work Programs and Welfare Reform: Research into JOBS Suggests that Work is Central to Reform*, The American Public Welfare Association, New York: Manpower Demonstration Research Corporation, Summer 1995.

Gueron, Judith M., and Pauly, Edward. *From Welfare to Work*, Manpower Demonstration Research Corporation, New York, N.Y.: Russell Sage Foundation, 1991.

Hamilton, Gayle. *The JOBS Evaluation: Monthly Participation Rates in Three Sites and Factors Affecting Participation Levels in Welfare-to-Work Programs: Executive Summary*, U.S. Department of Health and Human Services and U.S. Department of Education, New York: Manpower Demonstration Research Corporation, September 1995.

Hanson, Erik J. *Welfare Trends in Scandinavian Countries*, Armonk, N.Y.: Sharpe, 1993.

Human Resources Development Canada. *Evaluation of the Employability Initiative for Social Assistance Recipients (SARS) in CJS*, Ottawa: April 1994.

Human Resources Development Canada. *Implementation Study of the Employment Resource Centre (ERC): Final Report*, Ottawa: February 1995.

Humanité Services Planning Ltd. *Evaluation of Workplace Supports Pilot Project*, Alberta: April 1994.

Jenkinson, Michael. "Off Welfare and Into the Banks: Edmonton Goodwill Scores With Teller Training Program," *Western Report*, XIII (19), June 7, 1993, 43-44.

KPMG Management Consulting. *Assessment of Initiatives for Social Assistance Recipients in Local Communities: Project Report*, Alberta Advanced Education and Career Development, April 1993.

KPMG Management Consulting. *Evaluation of Effectiveness and Efficiency: Alberta Vocational College*, Alberta Advanced Education and Career Development, March 1994.

Kemple, James J. and Haimson, Joshua. *Florida's Project Independence: Program Implementation, Participation Patterns, and First Year Impacts: Executive Summary*, New York: Manpower Demonstration Research Corporation, January, 1994.

Knox, Virginia W., Brown, Amy, Lin, Winston. *An Early Report on Minnesota's Approach to Welfare Reform: The Minnesota Family Investment Program: Executive Summary*, New York: Manpower Demonstration Research Corporation, November 1995.

Leiman, Joan M. and Seesel, Thomas. *The WIN Labs: A Federal/Local Partnership in Social Research*, New York: Manpower Demonstration Research Corporation, July 1992.

Lévesque, Suzanne. *Le program APPORT et son impact sur la dépendance à la sécurité du revenu: Faits saillants d'une analyse de mai 1992 du MMSRFP*, Gouvernement du Québec, Ministère de la Main-d'oeuvre, de la Sécurité du revenu et de la Formation professionnelle, Juillet 1992.

Levy-Coughlin Partnership. *jobsOntario Training Participant and Employer Survey Results: Executive Summary*, Ontario Ministry of Education and Training, March 1995.

Lindbeck, Assar. "The Welfare State and the Employment Problem," *Raising the Employment and Pay of the Working Poor*, AEA Papers and Proceedings, May 1994, 71-75.

Lund, Arvik. *Social Policy and the Welfare State in Sweden*, Lund Studies in Social Welfare no. 3, 1990.

Manitoba Task Force on Social Assistance. *Report of the Manitoba Task Force on Social Assistance*, 1983.

Manpower Demonstration Research Corporation. *Annual Report*, New York: 1994.

Martell Consulting Services and Collins Management Consulting and Research. *Process Evaluation of the Nova Scotia Compass Program*, October 1995.

Mijanovich, Tod and Long, David. *Creating and Alternative to Welfare: First-Year Findings on the Implementation, Welfare Impacts, and Costs of the Self-Sufficiency Project*, Vancouver: Social Research and Demonstration Corporation, December 1995.

Myles, John. *When Markets Fail: Social Welfare in Canada and the United States*, United Nations Research Institute for Social Development, Geneva: Discussion Paper no. 68, June 1995.

National Council of Welfare. *First Thoughts About Reforming Social Programs: Unemployment Insurance and Welfare*, Ottawa: Social Security Backgrounder no. 1.

National Council on Welfare. *Incentives and Disincentives to Work*, Ottawa: Autumn 1993.

National Council of Welfare. *Income Assistance for Families With Children*, Ottawa: Social Security Backgrounder no. 3.

National Council of Welfare. *Welfare and Other Income Support Programs*, Ottawa: Social Security Backgrounder no. 5.

National Council of Welfare. *Welfare in Canada: The Tangled Safety Net*, Ottawa: November 1987.

National Council of Welfare. *Welfare Reform*, Ottawa: Summer 1992.

National Council of Welfare. *Who Are The People on Welfare?*, Ottawa: Social Security Backgrounder no. 2.

National Council of Welfare. *Working for Welfare*, Ottawa: Social Security Backgrounder no. 4.

New Brunswick Advisory Council on the Status of Women. *Women and Financial Assistance in New Brunswick: A Preliminary Study*, 1988.

Nichols Applied Management. *Employment Alternatives Program Evaluation Study: Phase II Final Report*, Alberta Career Development and Employment, August 1990.

Nichols Applied Management. *Evaluation of the Training on the Job Program*, Alberta Advanced Education and Career Development, July 1995.

O'Neill, June. *Work and Welfare in Massachusetts: An Evaluation of the ET Program*, Pioneer Institute for Public Policy Research, Pioneer Paper no. 3, Boston, Mass: 1990.

Ostow, Miriam, and Dutka, Anna B. *Work and Welfare in New York City*, Baltimore Md., and London: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1975.

Phelps, Edmund S. "Low Wage Employment Subsidies versus the Welfare State," *Raising the Employment and Pay of the Working Poor*, AEA Papers and Proceedings, May 1994, 54-58.

Price Waterhouse. *Expérimentation des session prolongées de clubs de recherche d'emploi pour les prestataires de la sécurité du revenu: Phase 1 - Évaluation d'implantation*, Gouvernement du Québec, Ministère de la Sécurité du revenu, Juin 1993.

Quiviger, Claude. *European Approaches to Long-Term Unemployment: Literature Review*, Canadian Council on Social Development, Ottawa: 1991.

Rein, Mildred. *Dilemmas of Welfare Policy: Why Work Strategies Haven't Worked*, New York, N.Y.: Praeger Publishers, 1982.

Riccio, James, Friedlander, Daniel, Freedman, Stephen. *GAIN: Benefits, Costs, and Three-Year Impacts of a Welfare-to-Work Program: California's Greater Avenues for Independence Program: Executive Summary*, New York: Manpower Demonstration Research Corporation, September 1994.

Riccio, James A., and Orenstein, Alan. "Understanding Best Practices For Operating Welfare-To-Work Programs," *Evaluation Review* XX (1), 1996, 3-28.

Richards, John and Vining, Adrian; Brown, D. M.; Krashinsky, M.; Milne, W.J.; Lightman, E.S.; and Hoy, S.; *Helping the Poor: A Qualified Case for "Workfare"*, (Richards, John, and Watson, William G., eds.), The Social Policy Challenge, no. 5, Toronto: C.D. Howe Institute, February 1995.

Roy, Marie-Renée. *Expérimentation de sessions prolongées de club de recherche d'emploi auprès de prestataires de la sécurité du revenu: étude d'impact*, Gouvernement du Québec, Ministère de la Sécurité du revenu, Août 1994.

SP Research Associates. *A Summary of Evaluations of Employment and Training Programs in Saskatchewan for Social Assistance Recipients: 1984-1993*, Regina: December 1993.

SP Research Associates. *Report: Employability Enhancement Evaluation Meeting*, Ottawa: February 13-14, 1990.

SP Research Associates. *What Works For Whom, Evaluating Employment and Training Programs for Social Assistance Recipients in Canada: A Review of the Literature*, Ottawa: Policy and Consultation Branch, Strategic Planning Division, Health Canada, August 1993.

Servan Consulting. *CDMS Verification Survey: Testing the Reliability of Existing Client Data*, Alberta Advanced Education and Career Development, June 1995.

Smith Nightingale, Demetra, and Haveman, Robert H., eds. *The Work Alternative: Welfare Reform and the Realities of the Job Market*, Washington, D.C.: Urban Institute Press, 1994.

Smith Nightingale, Demetra; Wissoker, D.A.; Burbridge, L.C.; Bawden, D.L.; and Jeffries, N. *Evaluation of the Massachusetts Employment and Training (ET) Program*, Urban Institute Report 91-1, Washington D.C.; Urban Institute Press, 1991.

Smith, Vernon K. *Welfare Work Incentives: The earnings Exemption and its Impact Upon AFDC Employment, Earnings, and Program Costs*, Studies in Welfare Policy, no. 2, State of Michigan, Michigan Department of Social Services, 1974.

Social Planning Council of Ottawa-Carleton. *Employment Initiatives for Welfare Recipients*, Ottawa: Ontario Social Assistance Review Committee, November 1986.

Sorenson, Elaine, and Clark, Sandra. "A Child-Support Assurance Program: How Much Will It Reduce Child Poverty, and at What Cost?," *Economic Issues for Work and Family*, AEA Papers and Proceedings, May 1994, 114-119.

Stephens, John. *The Scandinavian Welfare States: Achievements, Crisis and Prospects*, United Nations Research Institute for Social Development, Geneva: Discussion Paper no. 67, June 1995.

Tarte, Françoise and Boisvert, Alain. *Relance auprès des prestataires de la sécurité du revenu ayant participé à un programme de développement de l'employabilité ou d'intégration en emploi: Deuxième volet*, Gouvernement du Québec, Ministère de la Sécurité du revenu, Février 1994.

Task Force on Approaches to Full Employment, *A Critical Review of Income Support Programs in Metro*, Working Paper, Halifax: City of Halifax, September, 1988.

Task Force on Transition into Employment, *Putting the Pieces Together: Toward a Coherent Transition System for Canada's Labour Force*, Ottawa: Canadian Labour Force Development Board, 1994.

Tremblay, Monique. *Valeur de la production des prestataires participant aux programmes travaux communautaires et stages en milieu de travail*, Gouvernement du Québec, Ministère de la Main-d'oeuvre et de la Sécurité du revenu, Juin 1990.

Tremblay, Monique and Tremblay, Louis. *Analyse coûts-bénéfices des programmes de développement de l'employabilité et d'aide à l'emploi*, Gouvernement du Québec, Ministère de la Sécurité du revenu, Février 1991.

Turner, Joanne C., and Turner, Francis J., eds. *Canadian Social Welfare*, Scarborough, Canada: Allyn & Bacon Canada, 1995.

U.S. Department of Labor. *What's Working (and What's Not): A Summary of Research on the Economic Impacts of Employment and Training Programs*, Washington: Office of the Chief Economist, January 1995.

Warburton, Bill. *Routes to Independence: The Effectiveness of Employment and Training Programs for Income Assistance Recipients in British Columbia*, Province of British Columbia, Ministry of Social Services, Research, Evaluation and Statistics Branch, October 1992.

Welfare Assistance Review Committee. *Dignity, Security and Opportunity*, Prince Edward Island: Minister of Health and Social Services, February 1989.

Westlake Consulting. *Evaluation of Academic Upgrading Programs Utilizing Computer Assisted Instruction in Calgary: Final Report*, Alberta: February 1994.

Zalinger, David and Bradley, Susan. *Program Evaluation: Pre-Employment Training Program for Social Assistance Recipients*, Alberta Career Development and Employment, March 1992.

_____. *Employability Resources Network: Final Report*, Ottawa: August 1991.

_____. *Evaluation of the Student Work and Service Program (SWASP) - Newfoundland and Labrador: Final Report*, Strategic Initiatives Evaluation Committee, Human Resources Development Canada, and Province of Newfoundland and Labrador, August 1995.

_____. *Persons With Disabilities: A Supplemental Paper*, Improving Social Security in Canada, Toronto: Ministry of Human Resources, 1994.

_____. *Regional Liaison Committees Workshop Report*, Gander: November 25-26, 1993.

_____. *Strategic Planning Workshop Report*, Canada/Newfoundland Social Assistance Recipient Agreement, St. John's: March 17-19, 1993.

_____. "The Welfare State: Thinking the Unthinkable, Behind Current Arguments Over Tax Lurks The Thorny Question of Welfare Reform," *The Economist* CCCXXXIX (7963), April 27, 1996, 60-62.

_____. "Training for Jobs: O Brave New World," *The Economist*, March 12, 1994, 19-26.